



**Keswick:  
A Bibliographic Introduction  
to the Higher Life Movements**

BY DAVID BUNDY

OCCASIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHIC PAPERS  
OF THE B.L. FISHER LIBRARY #3



*First Fruits*  
THE ACADEMIC OPEN PRESS OF ASBURY SEMINARY

ISBN: 9780984738755

Keswick: a Bibliographic Introduction to the Higher Life Movements, by  
David D. Bundy.

First Fruits Press, © 2012

B. L. Fisher Library, Asbury Theological Seminary, © 1975

Digital version at <http://place.asburyseminary.edu/firstfruitspapers/2/>

First Fruits Press is a digital imprint of the Asbury Theological Seminary, B.L. Fisher Library. Asbury Theological Seminary is the legal owner of the material previously published by the Pentecostal Publishing Co. and reserves the right to release new editions of this material as well as new material produced by Asbury Theological Seminary. Its publications are available for noncommercial and educational uses, such as research, teaching and private study. First Fruits Press has licensed the digital version of this work under the Creative Commons Attribution Noncommercial 3.0 United States License. To view a copy of this license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/us/>.

For all other uses, contact:

First Fruits Press  
B.L. Fisher Library  
Asbury Theological Seminary  
204 N. Lexington Ave.  
Wilmore, KY 40390  
<http://place.asburyseminary.edu/firstfruits>

---

Bundy, David D.

Keswick : a bibliographic introduction to the higher life movements [electronic resource] / by H.C. Morrison.

1 online resource : digital.

Wilmore, Ky. : First Fruits Press, c2012.

Digital republication: Previously published: Wilmore, Ky. : Digital republication:

Previously published: Wilmore, Ky. : B. L. Fisher Library, Asbury Theological Seminary, c1975.

94 p.

ISBN: 9780984738755

Occasional bibliographic papers of the B.L Fisher Library series; no. 3

1. Keswick movement--Bibliography. I. Title.

Z7776.5 .M8X 2012eb

---

Cover design by Haley Hill



asburyseminary.edu  
800.2ASBURY  
204 North Lexington Avenue  
Wilmore, Kentucky 40390







Keswick: A Bibliographic  
Introduction to the Higher Life  
Movement

by

David Bundy

Occasional Bibliographic Papers of the B.L. Fisher

Library #3

First Fruits Press  
Wilmore, Kentucky  
c2012



asburyseminary.edu  
800.2ASBURY  
204 North Lexington Avenue  
Wilmore, Kentucky 40390



*First Fruits*  
THE ACADEMIC OPEN PRESS OF ASBURY SEMINARY

KESWICK:  
A BIBLIOGRAPHIC INTRODUCTION  
TO  
THE HIGHER LIFE MOVEMENTS

KESWICK:  
A BIBLIOGRAPHIC INTRODUCTION  
TO  
THE HIGHER LIFE MOVEMENTS

by  
David D. Bundy

The Third in a Series of  
"Occasional Bibliographic Papers  
of the B. L. Fisher Library"

B. L. Fisher Library  
Asbury Theological Seminary  
Wilmore, Kentucky 40390  
1975

Occasional Bibliographic Papers of the  
B. L. Fisher Library:

- No. 1. The American Holiness Movement; a Bibliographic Introduction. Donald W. Dayton. 1971. 59 p. \$2.00. Out-of-print. New edition in process.
- No. 2. The American Pentecostal Movement; a Bibliographic Essay. David W. Faupel. 1972. 56 p. \$2.00.
- No. 3. Keswick: a Bibliographic Introduction to the Higher Life Movements. David D. Bundy. 1975. 89 p. \$3.00.

All rights reserved by  
The B. L. Fisher Library  
Asbury Theological Seminary

Order Information

Prices listed above for 1 - 10 copies. For 11 or more copies the price per copy is reduced by fifty cents (\$0.50) plus postage and handling unless payment accompanies order.

ISBN 0-914368-03-6

Address:

Director of Library Services  
B. L. Fisher Library  
Asbury Theological Seminary  
Wilmore, Ky. 40390



## PREFACE

This third monograph in the series, "Occasional Bibliographic Papers of the B. L. Fisher Library" follows Donald W. Dayton's THE AMERICAN HOLINESS MOVEMENT: A BIBLIOGRAPHIC INTRODUCTION and David W. Faupel's THE AMERICAN PENTECOSTAL MOVEMENT, A BIBLIOGRAPHICAL ESSAY, at the suggestion of Dr. Melvin Dieter.

I wish to express appreciation to Dr. Susan A. Schultz, Director of the B. L. Fisher Library of Asbury Theological Seminary, for her patient encouragement throughout the duration of the project and for her critical evaluation of the manuscript.

A special debt of gratitude is owed to the persons who in responding to the first draft of this essay saved me from a multitude of errors and provided suggestions from the areas of their expertise: Dr. James Hamilton, Asbury College, has a prodigious knowledge of nineteenth century America and England; Dr. Melvin Dieter\*, Director of Wesleyan Educational Institutions, and Mr. Donald W. Dayton, Director of Mellander Library and Assistant Professor of Theology at North Park Theological Seminary, are thoroughly aware of the literature and history of the European "Higher Life" Movements and the American Holiness Movement; Mr. David W. Faupel, Assistant Professor of Bibliography and Research at Asbury Theological Seminary has special expertise with regard to the literature of Pentecostalism and has continually provided insights and encouragement during the evolution of this essay; Dr. J. Edwin Orr graciously provided suggestions incorporated herein. I alone accept responsibility for any errors which may remain, and would appreciate information on any inaccuracy discovered by the readers.

I am also grateful for access to several excellent collections and to the unfailing generosity and kind helpfulness of librarians and their staff assistants: Garrett-Evangelical Seminary; Moody Bible Institute; The Southern Baptist Theological Seminary; The Regenstein Library; The University of Chicago; and especially the B. L. Fisher Library, Asbury Theological Seminary. Access to the personal collections of Dr. James Hamilton and Mr. Donald W. Dayton provided materials which filled serious lacunae in my research.

Finally, I wish to express my sincere thanks to Mrs. Joan Smith, Mrs. Wendy Ferns and Mrs. Kris Cryderman who cheerfully and accurately typed from manuscripts that were usually difficult, to Mrs. Gilbert (Esther) James who with patient persistence edited the text and verified bibliographic entries, and to Mrs. Linda Gates who prepared the final copy for printing.

One further word of explanation is due. For historic purposes the publication dates for titles listed are the earliest that could be established, and for brevity's sake, normally, only one publisher is cited. Many of these titles were published on both sides of the Atlantic; many reprints were issued. Please consult both the U. S. and British BOOKS-IN-PRINT for current publication data.

David D. Bundy  
Instructor in Greek  
Asbury Theological Seminary

\* As of September 1, 1975, Dr. Dieter is Associate Professor of Church History, Asbury Theological Seminary.



## Contents

Preface	5
Introduction and Definition	9
History and Influence of Keswick	10
Setting the Stage	10
Histories of Keswick	24
Influence of Keswick	28
The Welsh Revival	28
The German Holiness Movement	30
Foreign Missions	32
Conventions Abroad	35
The American Holiness Movement	42
The American Pentecostal Movement	47
The Christian and Missionary Alliance	49
Literature of Keswick	52
Bibliography	53
Theological Studies	53
Biblical Studies	70
Sermonic and Devotional Studies	75
Hymnody	80
Periodicals	81
Index	85

## INTRODUCTION AND DEFINITION

A difficult problem in attempting to prepare an introduction to the literature of the Keswick Movement is the matter of definition. Keswick, a small town in northwest England, has since 1875 been the site of the famed Keswick Convention. The Keswick Convention is not a denomination. It has no membership rolls. Nor does Keswick have a precisely delimited tradition. The Keswick Convention is, instead, an amorphous conglomerate of individuals and groups who are in sympathy with the teachings and lifestyle as taught at the annual meeting and proclaimed in the official record of the Keswick Convention, THE KESWICK WEEK, an annual report of the meeting at Keswick.

The well-known motto of the Convention, founded with the aim of "the promotion of practical holiness," is "All One in Christ Jesus." Doctrinal and ecclesiastical differences are minimized for one week each year as evangelical Christians gather to pursue a life of personal holiness. In classical theological categories, they strive together for sanctification (progressive) attained by a suppression of sinful desires and tendencies within individual men.

Keswick, albeit often ignored by church historians, has had an influence during the past century upon the Christian world far out of proportion to its humble, faltering beginnings. Its followers have sought to transplant the dynamic of the Keswick Convention, resulting in "Keswick" camps and conferences in Canada, India, the United States of America, South Africa, Scotland, Germany, France, the West Indies, and the Orient. Keswick has had monumental influence on American Fundamentalism, Pentecostalism, and the American Holiness Movement.

The method of this essay will be to introduce the reader to the bibliography of the Keswick Convention and to indicate sources necessary for understanding the impact of the Convention around the world. Literature will be presented around the foci of: (1) History of Keswick and Its Influence; (2) Resources for Bibliography; (3) Theological and Biblical Studies; (4) Devotional Literature; (5) Hymnody; (6) Periodicals; and (7) Historical Collections. Due to the absence of the usual denominational or traditional structures, the history of the Keswick Convention and of its influence throughout Christendom is the story of the efforts of and direction given by individuals within the common cause of the higher life. Therefore, a significant portion of the data provided herein focuses upon the lives of illustrious men and women.

## HISTORY AND INFLUENCE OF KESWICK

### Setting the Stage

In order that a more adequate designation and understanding of this group can occur, a sketch of the milieu of the origins of the movement is offered.

The church in England in the middle of the nineteenth century was plagued with faltering popular enthusiasm for the religious institutions, accentuated by the rivalry of three major religious parties. The High Church party had been recently invigorated by liturgical renewal at the impetus of the Oxford Movement.<sup>1</sup> The Broad Church party sought to

---

1. The Oxford Movement stimulated an immense literature. Especially helpful in understanding the movement and its impact are H. P. Liddon, *THE LIFE OF E. B. PUSEY*, 4 vols. (London; New York: Longmans, Green, 1893-97); R.W.

revitalize itself on a platform of social reform and by adopting German theological constructs and Darwinian concepts.<sup>2</sup> The Low Church party<sup>3</sup> was strongly influenced by British Methodism, emphasizing the Bible and personal religious experience. Each party strove to improve the church and to influence the church politically in favor of its alternative: all of this under the aegis of Anglicanism.<sup>4</sup> Outside Anglicanism, the Plymouth Brethren and, to some extent, British Methodism offered the alternative of a strict lit-

---

Church, THE OXFORD MOVEMENT. TWELVE YEARS, 1833-1845 (London: Macmillan, 1891); S. Baring-Gould, THE CHURCH REVIVAL (London: Methuen, 1914); S. L. Ollard, A SHORT HISTORY OF THE OXFORD MOVEMENT (London: A. R. Mowbray, 1915). For additional bibliography see F. L. Cross, ed., OXFORD DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN CHURCH, pp. 1001-1002; James Hastings, ed., ENCYCLOPAEDIA OF RELIGION AND ETHICS, IX, (1917), 585-589.

2. For tendencies of this movement, ESSAYS AND REVIEWS (10th ed.; London: Longman, Green, Longman, & Roberts, 1862); also F. W. Cornish, THE ENGLISH CHURCH IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY, 2 vols. (London: Macmillan, 1910). For additional study suggestions see OXFORD DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN CHURCH, p. 199.

3. The Low Church party was commonly termed "Evangelical." See J. H. Overton, THE EVANGELICAL REVIVAL IN THE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY (London: Longmans, Green, 1900), and H. G. C. Moule, THE EVANGELICAL SCHOOL IN THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND (London: J. Nisbet, 1901).

4. The biographical study of the proponents of the various options in the Church of England is of primary interest.

eralistic interpretation of Scripture, a conservative pietistic lifestyle, and a simple faith. But it was the Low Church party and other "evangelicals" from within the Anglican tradition that were to provide the majority of the Keswickians.

A second important factor in the origins of the Keswick Movement was the concern for the higher life, resulting from the overflow of American pietistic revivalism;<sup>5</sup> or, as phrased by Robert S. Fletcher, HISTORY OF OBERLIN COLLEGE (Oberlin: Oberlin College, 1943), "the Oberlinizing of England."<sup>6</sup> Asa

---

5. Although the most immediate stimuli came from America, Keswick apologists trace their heritage in earlier writers. W. H. Griffith Thomas observes in an essay, "The Literature of Keswick," in C. F. Harford's THE KESWICK CONVENTION, ITS MESSAGE, ITS METHOD AND ITS MEN (London: Marshall Brothers, n.d.), p. 223, "... the roots of the distinctive teachings can easily be traced in the writings of Walter Marshall, William Law, John Wesley, Fletcher of Madeley, Thomas à Kempis, Brother Lawrence, Madame Guyon, the letters of Samuel Rutherford and the Memoir of McCheyne." Of Walter Marshall, THE GOSPEL MYSTERY OF SANCTIFICATION (1692), Thomas comments, p. 223, "...[in Marshall], the essential theology of the KESWICK MOVEMENT is clearly seen;..." The Bonars and George Müller were also influential. See also M. E. Dieter, "The Holiness Revival in Nineteenth Century Europe," WESLEYAN THEOLOGICAL JOURNAL 9, (1974), 15-27. See also Dieter, "Revivalism and Holiness," Ph.D. dissertation at Temple University, 1973, available in bound copy from University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Michigan, order number 73-18, 681.

6. Also see the chronicle by a former President of Oberlin College, James H. Fair-



Mahan<sup>7</sup> and Charles Grandison Finney<sup>8</sup> visited England in 1849 and met with significant successes in evangelistic work, building upon the impact of their writings, especially Finney's LECTURES ON REVIVALS OF RELIGION (New

---

child, OBERLIN: THE COLONY AND THE COLLEGE 1833-1883 (Oberlin: E. J. Goodrich, 1883).

7. Asa Mahan, like Upham, has been appropriated by the Holiness, Pentecostal, and Keswick Movements. See note 15 in Donald W. Dayton, THE AMERICAN HOLINESS MOVEMENT, A BIBLIOGRAPHIC INTRODUCTION. Mr. Dayton in 1973 read papers at both the Wesleyan Theological Society and the Society of Pentecostal Studies which should soon be available in the organs of the respective societies. Barbara Zikmund's Duke University Ph.D. dissertation, "Asa Mahan and Oberlin Perfectionism," available through University Microfilms in hard-bound copy (University Microfilms order #70-11, 599), is a good introduction both to the genius of Mahan and to literature by and about him.

Mahan's philosophical writings continue to attract attention, especially, A SYSTEM OF INTELLECTUAL PHILOSOPHY (New York: Saxon & Miles, 1845), A CRITICAL HISTORY OF PHILOSOPHY, 2 vols. (New York: Phillips and Hunt, 1883), and SCIENCE OF MORAL PHILOSOPHY (Oberlin: Fitch, 1848).

8. Charles Grandison Finney's most significant volume, LECTURES ON REVIVALS OF RELIGION, ed. William G. McLoughlin (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1960), (original ed. 1835). His MEMOIRS OF CHARLES G. FINNEY (New York: Revell, 1876), have been kept in print by Revell as THE AUTOBIOGRAPHY OF CHARLES G. FINNEY. See also Aaron Merritt Hills, LIFE OF CHARLES G. FINNEY (Cincinnati: Office of GOD'S REVIVALIST, 1902).

York: Leavitt and Lord, 1835) and Mahan's SCRIPTURE DOCTRINE OF CHRISTIAN PERFECTION; WITH OTHER KINDRED SUBJECTS ILLUSTRATED AND CONFIRMED IN A SERIES OF DISCOURSES DESIGNED TO THROW LIGHT ON THE WAY OF HOLINESS (Boston: D. S. King, 1839). Mahan had also received attention in philosophical circles (see note 7). The Scottish realistic philosophy pioneered by Thomas Reid, culminating in the work of Sir William Hamilton under whom C. G. Moore and his father studied, provided a foundation which Mahan's perfectionism and Finney's revivalism interpenetrated to undergird a significant social reform movement. The result of primary interest for this essay is the influence of the men and their writings on others who would sensitize the consciousness of the British churches regarding personal holiness; for example, I. E. Page and John Brash, co-editors of THE KING'S HIGHWAY, Thornley Smith, Charles Grandison Moore who edited DIVINE LIFE (British Wesleyan-Holiness), also LIFE OF FAITH during the later tenure of Evan Hopkins. Moore, named after Finney, was a close friend of Mahan and later editor of his works and executor of his estate. He continuously added an "Oberlin" perspective to the Keswickian and Methodist-Holiness periodicals which he edited.

Also influential was the indefatigable James Caughey.<sup>9</sup> Caughey, who had been closely associated with Phoebe Palmer and influenced by Mahan and Finney, began revivalistic tours in

---

9. In addition to the works cited, HELPS TO A LIFE OF HOLINESS AND USEFULNESS; OR, REVIVAL MISCELLANIES, eds. Ralph W. Allen and Daniel Wise (Boston: J.P. Magee, 1851), and SHOWERS OF BLESSING FROM CLOUDS OF MERCY; selected from the Journal and other writings of the Rev. James Caughey (Boston: J. P. Magee, 1857).

England as early as 1841. His successes are chronicled in THE TRIUMPH OF TRUTH AND CONTINENTAL LETTERS AND SKETCHES FROM THE JOURNAL, LETTERS AND SERMONS OF THE REV. JAMES CAUGHEY WITH AN INTRODUCTION BY JOSEPH CASTLE (Philadelphia: Higgins and Perkinpine, 1857), and EARNEST CHRISTIANITY, ILLUSTRATED; OR, SELECTIONS FROM THE JOURNAL OF REV. JAMES CAUGHEY WITH A BRIEF SKETCH OF MR. CAUGHEY'S LIFE by Daniel Wise (Boston: J. P. Magee, 1855).

In addition to the ministry and writings of these men, the writings of Thomas Upham<sup>10</sup> and William Arthur<sup>11</sup> were widely circulated.

The revival of 1857-1858 has been described by Timothy Smith, REVIVALISM AND SOCIAL REFORM (New York: Abingdon, 1957), and by J. Edwin Orr, THE SECOND EVANGELICAL AWAKENING IN BRITAIN (London & Edinburgh: Marshall,

---

10. Thomas Upham influenced both the Holiness Movement in America and Keswick. His LIFE AND RELIGIOUS OPINIONS AND EXPERIENCES OF MADAME DE LA MOTHE GUYON (N.Y.: Harper, 1847), has been frequently reprinted by H. R. Allenson as LIFE OF MADAME GUYON. PRINCIPLES OF THE INTERIOR OR HIDDEN LIFE (Boston: D. S. King, 1843), and other works are analyzed by Gregory Peck, "Dr. Upham's Works," METHODIST QUARTERLY REVIEW 28 (1846), 248-265. See also B. B. Warfield, PERFECTIONISM, II (New York: Oxford University Press, 1931), 337-459, and Melvin Easterday Dieter, "Revivalism and Holiness," chapter 2, pp. 64-68 and notes, 153-164.

11. British Wesleyan-Methodist William Arthur, TONGUE OF FIRE (London: Hamilton, Adams, 1856), was widely circulated in American Holiness, Pentecostal and British Keswick circles; its continued influence is attested by frequent reprintings.

Morgan and Scott, 1949), and THE SECOND EVANGELICAL AWAKENING IN AMERICA (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1952). Both of Orr's books were abridged into a more popular account, THE SECOND EVANGELICAL AWAKENING, AN ACCOUNT OF THE SECOND WORLDWIDE EVANGELICAL REVIVAL BEGINNING IN THE MID NINETEENTH CENTURY (London & Edinburgh: Marshall, Morgan and Scott, 1955). A portion of the first volume was printed under the title, AMERICA'S GREAT REVIVAL (Elizabethtown, Pa.: McBeth Press, 1957). More accessible is his THE LIGHT OF THE NATIONS: EVANGELICAL RENEWAL AND ADVANCE IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1965), which is a more general discussion of the period.

The message of the American-originated revival was then transported abroad. Mahan returned to England, where he was in continual demand as a speaker; James Caughey worked in close cooperation with Phoebe and Dr. W. C. Palmer whose efforts are detailed in FOUR YEARS IN THE OLD WORLD; COMPRISING THE TRAVELS, INCIDENTS AND EVANGELISTIC LABORS OF DR. AND MRS. PALMER IN ENGLAND, IRELAND, SCOTLAND AND WALES (New York: Foster and Palmer, 1866). Finney undertook another tour of the British Isles. The dramatic results have been ably chronicled by Orr.

During the two decades following the English revivals of 1858-1859 holiness conventions were going on all over England. Mahan, through his involvement in the pre-Keswick conferences discussed below and his editorship of DIVINE LIFE, helped to unify the higher life aspirations arising from the "Oberlinizing of England" and to focus them in the direction of the Wesleyan-Holiness theological heritage combined with an emphasis on the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Thus, the groundwork was laid for the visits of the Moody-Sankey team, the Robert Pearsall Smiths and William Edwin Boardman to England, France

12. William Edwin Boardman, a product of the "Burned-Over District" of New York and a graduate of Lane Theological Seminary, Cincinnati, was a controversial promoter of the higher life. Closely related to the American Holiness Movement, his very influential book, *THE HIGHER CHRISTIAN LIFE* (Boston: Henry Hoyt, 1859, revised 1871), argued that every Christian must achieve a higher plane of Christian life, entered by an act of faith as at justification. His theological perspective is critiqued by Jacob J. Abbott, "Boardman's Higher Christian Life," *BIBLIOTHECA SACRA AND BIBLICAL REPOSITORY*, 17 (July 1860), 508-535; by John A. Todd, "Law of Spiritual Growth," *THE BIBLICAL REPERTORY AND PRINCETON REVIEW*, 32 (1860), 608-640. Both of these reviewers take Boardman to task for faulty scholarship and theological error. Boardman's work is also evaluated by Warfield, *PERFECTIONISM*, II, 463-494. The most severe critique is that of Henry A. Boardman, "THE HIGHER LIFE" *DOCTRINE OF SANCTIFICATION TRIED BY THE WORD OF GOD* (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1877), which serves to evaluate the entire resultant movement. A less influential work was *IN THE POWER OF THE SPIRIT; OR, CHRISTIAN EXPERIENCE IN THE LIGHT OF THE BIBLE* (London: Daldy, Isbister, 1875). Despite the obvious shortcomings of his work, Boardman, perhaps more than anyone else, raised interest in the possibility of the higher Christian life. His life has been chronicled by his wife, *THE LIFE AND LABORS OF THE REV. W. E. BOARDMAN* (New York: Appleton, 1887). It is enthusiastic and at times self-contradictory but no more adequate work has been produced.

W. E. Boardman, *THE HIGHER CHRISTIAN LIFE* (Boston: Henry Hoyt, 1858), is credited by

In 1872 Mr. & Mrs. Robert Pearsall Smith,<sup>13</sup> Quakers from the American Holiness Movement, sought respite in England from their American religious and mercantile labors. They

---

Steven Barabas, *SO GREAT SALVATION, THE HISTORY AND MESSAGE OF THE KESWICK MOVEMENT* (Westwood, N. J.: Revell, 1952), p. 16, as being the most influential in arousing interest in sanctification and the Spirit-filled life.

In addition to Mahan, Boardman, and Arthur, the writings of Richard Poole, *CENTER AND CIRCLE OF EVANGELICAL RELIGION; OR, PERFECT LIFE* (London: Jarrold, 1873), and Hannah Whitall Smith, *THE CHRISTIAN'S SECRET OF A HAPPY LIFE* (New York: Revell, 1875), had wide and influential circulation; as did the writings of George Müller, *NARRATIVE OF THE LORD'S DEALINGS WITH GEORGE MÜLLER*, (London: Nisbet, 1895), 1st ed., 1837 and in later American editions, *THE LIFE OF TRUST: with an introduction by Francis Wayland. THE DIARY OF GEORGE MÜLLER*, (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1954), was edited by A. Rendle Short. There are biographies by W. H. Harding, *THE LIFE OF GEORGE MÜLLER, A RECORD OF FAITH TRIUMPHANT* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1914), Basil W. Miller, *GEORGE MÜLLER, THE MAN OF FAITH; A BIOGRAPHY OF ONE OF THE GREATEST PRAYER-WARRIORS OF THE PAST CENTURY* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1951), and the often reprinted work of A. T. Pierson, *GEORGE MÜLLER OF BRISTOL AND HIS WITNESS TO A PRAYER-HEARING GOD* (New York: Baker and Taylor, 1899), containing a preface by Müller's son-in-law, James Wright.

13. Robert Pearsall Smith has not been the subject of any extensive critical biography. Some details may be gleaned from the writings of his wife, Hannah Whitall Smith, and their son, Logan Pearsall Smith,

were soon involved in meetings of select groups in private homes, and in 1873, togeth-

---

but most of his life remains shrouded from view. Most helpful are Logan Pearsall Smith, UNFORGOTTEN YEARS (Boston: Little, Brown, 1939); Hannah Whitall Smith; THE RECORD OF A HAPPY LIFE: BEING MEMORIALS OF FRANKLIN WHITALL SMITH (Philadelphia, Privately printed, 1873); "Smith, Robert Pearsall," DIE RELIGION IN GESCHICHTE UND GEGENWART, VI 1962 (3rd ed.; Tübingen: Mohr), 112; "The Religious Experience of R. Pearsall Smith," THE CHRISTIAN OBSERVER 75 (1875, London), 830 ff., 926 ff.; 76 (1876), 60 ff. Also available but less biographical are Fr. Winkler, "Robert Pearsall Smith und der Perfectionismus" in Friedrich D. Kropatscheck, BIBLISCHE ZEIT UND STREITFRAGEN ZUR AUFKLÄRUNG DER GEBILDETEN Series 10 (Berlin-Lichterfelde: Edwin Runge, 1914), 410-422 and Johannes Jüngst, AMERIKANISCHER METHODISMUS IN DEUTSCHLAND UND ROBERT PEARSALL SMITH (Gotha, F. A. Perthes, 1875). See also B. B. Warfield, PERFECTIIONISM, II (New York: Oxford University Press, 1931), and M. E. Dieter, "Revivalism and Holiness." The Cowper-Temple Correspondence, Broadlands Archives has material relating primarily to the period of the Broadlands Conference.

His own writings were very influential in provoking interest in the higher life in England. HOLINESS THROUGH FAITH; LIGHT ON THE WAY OF HOLINESS (London: Morgan and Scott, 1870), "WALK IN THE LIGHT." WORDS OF COUNSEL TO THOSE WHO HAVE ENTERED INTO "THE REST OF FAITH" (London: n.p., 1873), had a lasting influence. As editor of THE CHRISTIAN'S PATHWAY TO POWER he influenced the revival movements of America and England. An extensive listing of Smith's writings is found in Warfield, PERFECTIIONISM, II, 510.

er with W. E. Boardman they held a series of breakfasts focusing on the subject of the higher life. This served as a prelude to three conferences or conventions which, in turn, spawned the Keswick Convention.

The support of W. Cowper-Temple (later Lord Mount Temple), made possible the Conference of July 17-23, 1874 on his Broadlands estate.<sup>14</sup> One hundred attended, including George MacDonald, Theodore Monod,<sup>15</sup> Mrs. Amanda Smith,<sup>16</sup>

---

14. Material relevant to the Broadlands Convention may be found in the Cowper-Temple Correspondence at the Broadlands Archives; in Edna Jackson, *THE LIFE THAT IS LIFE INDEED: REMEMBRANCES OF THE BROADLANDS CONFERENCES* (London: Nisbet, 1910), and in most histories of the KESWICK MOVEMENT.

15. Theodore Monod, a pastor in Paris, influenced by Robert Pearsall Smith, was a well known figure in British higher life meetings. His books and tracts are still being reprinted, primarily by "Back to the Bible Broadcast," Box 82808, Lincoln, Nebraska 68501. *LOOKING UNTO JESUS* (Lincoln: BBB, 1973), 22 pps., contains a note indicating 625,000 copies of this tract have been published. *THE GIFT OF LIFE* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1912), *THE GIFT OF GOD* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1876), and *DENYING SELF*, ed. H. F. Bowker (London: Frome, 1878), and *LIFE MORE ABUNDANT* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1881), are all books of addresses delivered at higher life conferences, primarily at Keswick. No biographical material has been found, nor is there a comprehensive list of Monod's works. He was the author of the famous Keswick song, "None of Self and All of Thee."

16. Mrs. Amanda Smith, a former slave with little formal education, traveled through-



the Black holiness evangelist, and Canon Wilberforce. Robert Pearsall Smith was the chairman. Out of the concern that this type of conference be more widely available, the Oxford Convention,<sup>17</sup> August 29-September 7, 1874, featured Robert Pearsall Smith as chairman and principal speaker. His wife, Hannah Whitall Smith,<sup>18</sup> Theodore Monod, Evan H.

---

out the world "representing" the American Holiness Movement. Her AUTOBIOGRAPHY; THE STORY OF THE LORD'S DEALING WITH MRS. AMANDA SMITH, THE COLORED EVANGELIST, was published in 1893 by Meyer & Bro. of Chicago and recently reprinted (Noblesville, Ind.: J. Edwin Newby, 1962). See also, M. H. Cadbury, THE LIFE OF AMANDA SMITH, "THE AFRICAN SYBIL, THE CHRISTIAN SAINT," with an introduction by J. Rendel Harris (Birmingham, England: Cornish Bros., 1916), and Marshall William Taylor, THE LIFE, TRAVELS, LABORS, AND HELPERS OF MRS. AMANDA SMITH, THE FAMOUS NEGRO MISSIONARY EVANGELIST (Cincinnati: Cranston and Stowe, 1886).

17. ACCOUNT OF THE UNION MEETING FOR THE PROMOTION OF SCRIPTURAL HOLINESS, HELD AT OXFORD, August 29th to September 7th, 1874 (Chicago: Revell, 1874), is a rather wordy but detailed account of the proceedings. See also ADVOCATE OF CHRISTIAN HOLINESS 5 (1874), 134-135 and THE METHODIST MAGAZINE 17 (1874), 992-997. These and other Holiness Movement and/or Methodist periodicals carried enthusiastic reports of the convention.

18. Hannah Whitall Smith, as with her husband Robert Pearsall Smith, (see above) has not been the subject of critical biographies. She gives an account of their early religious experiences in THE RECORD OF A HAPPY LIFE: BEING MEMORIALS OF FRANKLIN WHITALL SMITH (Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1873), and of her own pilgrimage in THE UN-

Hopkins,<sup>19</sup> Asa Mahan, and W. E. Boardman also spoke.

---

SELFISHNESS OF GOD, AND HOW I DISCOVERED IT (London: J. Nisbet, 1903); the American edition, THE UNSELFISHNESS OF GOD, AND HOW I DISCOVERED IT; A SPIRITUAL AUTOBIOGRAPHY (N.Y.: Revell, 1903).

Her granddaughter, Ray Strachey (Rachel Costelloe), A QUAKER GRANDMOTHER (N.Y.: Revell, 1914), chronicles her last years, and in RELIGIOUS FANATICISM; EXTRACTS FROM THE PAPERS OF HANNAH WHITALL SMITH (London: Faber & Gwyer, 1928), presents aspects of her religious experiences. Logan Pearsall Smith, her son, published his reminiscences in UNFORGOTTEN YEARS (Boston: Little, Brown, 1939), and her letters in A RELIGIOUS REBEL: THE LETTERS OF "H.W.S." (London: Nisbet, 1949), with a biographical preface by Robert Gathorne-Hardy. [American edition: PHILADELPHIA QUAKER; THE LETTERS OF HANNAH WHITALL SMITH (N.Y.: Harcourt, Brace, 1950)].

Mrs. Smith was a very influential writer, far surpassing her husband. THE CHRISTIAN'S SECRET OF A HAPPY LIFE (N.Y.: Revell, 1875), originally published in her husband's periodical THE CHRISTIAN'S PATHWAY TO POWER, has been continuously reprinted and translated. Also important are: BIBLE READINGS ON THE PROGRESSIVE DEVELOPMENT OF TRUTH AND EXPERIENCE IN THE O.T. SCRIPTURES (London: Elliot Stock, 1878), BIBLE STUDIES ON THE HIGHER LIFE (London: Longley, 1891), THE VEIL UPLIFTED; OR, THE BIBLE ITS OWN INTERPRETER (London: Longley, 1886), LIVING IN THE SUNSHINE (N.Y.: Revell, 1906), published also as THE GOD OF ALL COMFORT (London: Nisbet, 1906), THE INTERIOR LIFE (London: Longley, 1886), and EVERY-DAY RELIGION; OR, THE COMMON-SENSE TEACHING OF THE BIBLE (N.Y.: Revell, 1893).

19. Evan Henry Hopkins (1837-1918), for many years the leader of Keswick and the chief

The Brighton Convention,<sup>20</sup> May 29-June 7, 1875, again with Smith as chairman, featured speakers of later Keswick fame: E. H. Hopkins, Stevenson A. Blackwood, H. W. Webb-Peploe and Theodore Monod. An exciting success, cheered on by Moody, it was the Smiths' last convention in England. The stage was set for the Keswick Convention.

---

guide in matters of doctrine, is the subject of a study by his friend, Alexander Smellie, EVAN HENRY HOPKINS. A MEMOIR (London: Marshall Bros., 1920), and in an introductory appreciation by Fred Mitchell in a reprint of Hopkins' most influential book, THE LAW OF LIBERTY IN THE SPIRITUAL LIFE (Philadelphia: The Sunday School Times, 1952). The first edition was published in London in 1884 by Marshall Brothers. Other significant works by Hopkins are BROKEN BREAD FOR DAILY USE, BEING THOUGHTS AND COMMENTS ON THE HEADLINE TEXTS OF "DAILY LIGHT ON THE DAILY PATH" (London: Samuel Bagster, 1895), HIDDEN YET POSSESSED (London: Marshall Bros., 1894), TALKS WITH BEGINNERS IN THE DIVINE LIFE (London: Marshall Bros., 1909), THOUGHTS ON LIFE AND GODLINESS (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1878), and THE WALK THAT PLEASES GOD (London: Marshall Bros., 1887).

20. RECORD OF THE CONVENTION FOR THE PROMOTION OF SCRIPTURAL HOLINESS HELD AT BRIGHTON, May 29th to June 7th, 1875 (Brighton: W. J. Smith, 1875), is a detailed account of the meetings, messages, and responses. Nearly eight thousand people attended the Convention including participants from France and Germany. The emphasis as recorded, is on the internal experience; little social concern is reflected, which a few decades before had been the heart cry of the American Holiness Movement which provided the impetus for Brighton. Indicative is the favorite hymn of the

## Histories of Keswick

The Reverend T. D. H. Battersby,<sup>21</sup> who attended the Oxford Convention, and a friend, Robert Wilson, initiated the first Keswick Convention and scheduled it to begin three weeks after the Brighton Convention. It was to be chaired by Smith, but he cancelled due to reasons still obscure, leaving Battersby supported by speakers Webb-Peploe, George R. Thornton, T. Phillips, H. F. Bowker, T. M. Croome and Murray Shipley to lead the circa 400 in

---

Convention, "Jesus Saves Me Now." Brighton was middle class in expression and in values. The entire movement therefore tended to be more "quietistic" than the American Holiness Movement. This is true, relatively, even today.

21. Canon Thomas Dundas Harford Battersby may be called the founder of the Keswick Convention. An Oxford graduate who had gone from High Church to Broad Church, he attended Oxford and Brighton, experiencing "resting faith." His sons wrote an apology for his life and beliefs, MEMOIR OF T. D. HARFORD-BATTERSBY, LATE VICAR OF ST. JOHN'S, KESWICK. . . TOGETHER WITH SOME ACCOUNT OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION. With a preface by H. C. G. Moule (London: Seeley, 1890). Battersby wrote and published several sermons on the holy life, CHRIST IN THE HEART (London: Wertheim, 1860), HIGHER ATTAINMENTS IN CHRISTIAN HOLINESS, AND HOW TO PROMOTE THEM (London: Nisbet, 1875). In 1878 he published BONDAGE OR LIBERTY? A SKETCH OF ST. PAUL'S TEACHING IN ROMANS VI-VIII (London: Hodder & Stoughton), a doctrinal apologetic for a Keswickian understanding of original sin, justification and sanctification. Battersby edited REMINISCENCES OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION (London: Partridge, 1879), discussed above.

attendance into the higher Christian life. The first meeting has been the focal point of several histories of the movement. Evan Hopkins, "Preliminary Stages" and Webb-Peploe and E. W. Moore, "Early Keswick Conventions," chapters in THE KESWICK CONVENTION, ITS MESSAGE, ITS METHOD AND ITS MEN (London: Marshall Bros., 1907), are accounts by participants, as are E. H. Hopkins, THE STORY OF KESWICK, Eighteenth Convention, 1892 (London: Life of Faith, 1892), and THE KESWICK JUBILEE SOUVENIR, THE STORY OF THE CONVENTION'S FIFTY YEARS' MINISTRY AND INFLUENCE (London: Marshall Bros., 1925). These are short, popular, and enthusiastically uncritical. Walter B. Sloan, THESE SIXTY YEARS, THE STORY OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION (London: Pickering and Inglis, n.d., 1935?), is a chronicle of the movement. Tedious in laborious detail, it plods through the years reading rather like minutes kept for business sessions. There are good photographs of the most influential men of the movement, but not a solitary bibliographic clue appears to lead the reader to his sources. Arthur Tappan Pierson,<sup>22</sup> THE KESWICK MOVEMENT, ITS PRECEPT AND PRACTICE, with introduction by Rev. Evan H. Hopkins (New York & London: Funk & Wagnalls, 1903) is an apologetic history of the movement and an effort to present the movement's theological

---

22. ARTHUR TAPPAN PIERSON, A SPIRITUAL WARRIOR, MIGHTY IN THE SCRIPTURES; A LEADER IN THE MODERN MISSIONARY CRUSADE (New York: Revell, 1912), is by his son, Delavan Leonard Pierson. An able apologist for the Keswick distinctives, A. T. P. wrote THE KESWICK MOVEMENT IN PRECEPT AND PRACTICE (New York: Funk & Wagnalls, 1903), and FORWARD MOVEMENTS OF THE LAST HALF CENTURY (New York: Funk & Wagnalls, 1900). Many of his works are listed in Jones, A GUIDE TO THE STUDY OF THE HOLINESS MOVEMENT.

foci. It is written carefully in popular style.

Battersby, REMINISCENCES OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION, 1879, WITH ADDRESSES BY PASTOR OTTO STOCKMAYER (London: S. W. Partridge, 1879), is a valuable bit of data (40 pp.). Of primary importance but hard to find and consequently ignored is Battersby, MEMOIR OF T. D. HARFORD BATTERSBY TOGETHER WITH SOME ACCOUNTS OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION, by two of his sons with a preface by H. C. G. Moule (London: Seeley, 1890). Evan H. Hopkins, that grand patriarch of the first decades, left his memoirs, A STANDARD BEARER OF FAITH AND HOLINESS; REMINISCENCES WITH A MEMOIR BY THE AUTHOR (London: Morgan and Scott, 1919). It is of little scientific value but its 47 pages provide one view of the beginnings.

From this same era comes J.B. Figgis, KESWICK FROM WITHIN (London: Marshall Bros., 1914), an indispensable but less than fluid commentary on the conventions. Figgis is an apologist for the movement as is the American professor at Crozer Theological Seminary, E. H. Johnson, THE HIGHEST LIFE, A STORY OF SHORT-COMINGS AND A GOAL; INCLUDING A FRIENDLY ANALYSIS OF THE KESWICK MOVEMENT (New York: A. C. Armstrong, 1901), which is not as friendly as the title would lead one to suspect. The British version of Keswick is given a higher rating than are the modifications of Moody at Northfield.

Steven Barabas, SO GREAT SALVATION, THE HISTORY AND MESSAGE OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION (Westwood, N. J.: Revell, 1952; London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1952), with a preface by Fred Mitchell, Chairman of the Keswick Convention Council 1948-1951, is still the standard history of the movement. It contains a sketch of the beginnings of the convention, an exposition of Keswickian teaching, biographical sketches of some Keswick leaders

and the most extensive bibliography of material related to Keswick and to the men of the movement. J. C. Pollock, *THE KESWICK STORY, THE AUTHORIZED HISTORY OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1964), is an attempt to popularize the history of the movement. The result is much more concern with dramatic effect than with the facts. It is of little scholarly value having neither documentation, bibliography nor concern for critical historical methodology. It is, however, the only chronicle of the World War II era and after, when Keswick was preoccupied with theology rather than history (see below, *Theology and Biblical Studies*).

Those outside the Keswick Convention made only limited efforts to analyze and understand the genius of Keswick. B. B. Warfield, *PERFECTIONISM*, 2 vols. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1931), gives considerable space to a critique of the early influences on the movement. He is very critical of their concerns. *PERFECTIONISM* has been reissued in a one volume edition (*Presbyterian and Reformed*, 1958), with the material on Thomas Upham deleted. More helpful and without the flaming prejudice of Warfield is the superb work of Melvin Easterday Dieter "Revivalism and Holiness" (see above note 5), Temple University Ph.D. dissertation, 1973, University Microfilms Order Number 73-18, 681. His article, "From Vineland and Menheim to Brighton and Berlin: The Holiness Revival in Nineteenth-Century Europe," *WESLEYAN THEOLOGICAL JOURNAL* 9 (1974), 15-27, draws heavily upon the dissertation, and is a sober, responsible analysis of the background of Keswick.

Finally, Herbert F. Stevenson, editor of *LIFE OF FAITH* has prepared a series of supplements to that periodical featuring the history of *LIFE OF FAITH*, formerly *THE CHRISTIAN'S PATHWAY TO POWER* founded by Robert Pearsall Smith and later edited by William E. Boardman,

Charles G. Moore<sup>23</sup> and Evan H. Hopkins, and J. K. Maclean. As the closest, although independent, organ of the Keswick Movement, a study of its history quite naturally shed light on Keswick.

### Influence of Keswick

The Welsh Revival. A fascinating problem of nationalism and of historiography is the relationship of the Keswick Convention to the Welsh Revival. Mrs. Jessie Penn-Lewis, THE AWAKENING IN WALES AND SOME OF THE HIDDEN SPRINGS...WITH AN INTRODUCTION TO THE WELSH REVIVALS BY J. CYNDDYLAN JONES (London: Marshall Bros., 1905), indicates that the roots of the revival in Wales were to be found in Keswick. The same approach is taken by Rhyc Bevan Jones, RENT HEAVENS, THE REVIVAL OF 1904, SOME OF ITS HIDDEN SPRINGS AND PROMINENT RESULTS (London: S. Martin, 1931). However, the assertion of dependency when voiced by F. B. Meyer provoked a running newspaper battle and eventual rejection of the Welsh Revival by Keswick.<sup>24</sup> For additional detail

---

23. Charles Grandison Moore was de facto editor during the tenure of Evan Hopkins. It was important to the early leaders that close ties be maintained with the Anglican Church, and Moore was a Methodist. He contributed a volume to the Keswick Library, 11, "THINGS WHICH CANNOT BE SHAKEN" (London: Marshall Bros., 1894), and abridged the autobiography of Amanda Smith for British readers.

24. See A. T. Pierson, "The Revival in Wales," EXPERIENCE, (July-Sept., 1905), pp. 94-97. He suggests that the revival had its origin in a "prayer-circle" formed at Keswick, 1902, consisting of Pierson, Moore, Albert Head and F. Paynter. The revival was compared to that of 1859 and heralded as "the beginning of the latter rain."



and references to articles, see Eifion Evans, THE WELSH REVIVAL OF 1904 (Port Talbot, Glamorgan: Evangelical Movement of Wales, 1969), the best analysis of the revival. J. C. Pollock, THE KESWICK STORY (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1964), gives the Keswick Convention's perspective on the interaction. Accounts by participants and onlookers include John Vyrnwy Morgan, THE WELSH REVIVAL, 1904-5, A RETROSPECT AND A CRITICISM (London: Chapman & Hall, 1909), who takes the phenomenon to task for its lack of tangible results beyond the rhetoric. David Matthews, I SAW THE WELSH REVIVAL (Chicago: Moody Press, 1957), is more popular, but helpful. J. Edwin Orr, THE FLAMING TONGUE, THE IMPACT OF THE TWENTIETH CENTURY REVIVALS (Chicago: Moody Press, 1973), seeks to measure the influence of the Welsh Revival, indicating its significance for understanding the Pentecostal Movement in America. An account of the Welsh Revival by the American Holiness leader, S. B. Shaw, THE GREAT REVIVAL IN WALES, ALSO AN ACCOUNT OF THE GREAT REVIVAL IN IRELAND IN 1859 (Chicago: S. B. Shaw, 1906), includes reports by Mrs. M. Baxter, F. B. Meyers and R. A. Torrey. The book figured prominently in the Azusa Street revivals, being widely read by the participants.

The life of Evan Roberts, whose meteoric rise and demise encompassed the greatest portion of this revival, has been chronicled by D. M. Phillips, EVAN ROBERTS, THE GREAT WELSH REVIVALIST AND HIS WORD, 3rd ed. (London: Marshall Bros., 1906). This is a tedious, enthusiastic reiteration of the bulk of Roberts' revivalistic efforts. A considerable quantity of correspondence is printed here. Mrs. Jessie Penn-Lewis, who cared for Roberts after his withdrawal from ministry (due, it is supposed, to a mental breakdown) became the leader of the continuing revival movement. In collaboration with Roberts, she wrote WAR ON THE SAINTS, A TEXTBOOK FOR BELIEVERS ON THE WORK

OF DECEIVING-SPIRITS AMONG THE CHILDREN OF GOD (London: Marshall Bros., 1912). She founded the OVERCOMER, a deeper life periodical, and served for several years as its editor. Her memoirs were published by Mary N. Garrard, MRS. PENN-LEWIS: A MEMOIR, COMPILED LARGELY FROM MRS. PENN-LEWIS' DIARIES AND NOTES (London: Overcomer Book Room, 1931).

The German Holiness Movement. Between the Oxford and Brighton conventions, Robert Pearsall Smith made a well received tour-crusade through Germany sponsored by the Free Churches. The literature on this tour and its results in German ecclesiastical history is fragmentary. The best English language summary of the Holiness Revival in Germany is in Melvin E. Dieter's, "Revivalism and Holiness," chapter IV (see note, 5).

The most prolific historian of the German Holiness Movement is Paul Fleisch, whose DIE HEILIGUNGSBEWEGUNG VON WESLEY BIS BOARDMAN, VOL. 1 of ZUR GESCHICHTE DER HEILIGUNGSBEWEGUNG, Erstes Heft (Leipzig: H. G. Wallman, 1910), must be the starting point of any future study. Emphasizing Boardman, he also discusses Oberlin theology as represented by Finney and Mahan. The theology of Thomas Upham and R. P. Smith are also treated. Two of his articles, "Der Heiligungslehre der Oxfordener Bewegung" NEUE KIRCHLICHE ZEITSCHRIFT 35 (1924), 49-87 and "Die Entstehung der deutschen Heiligungsbewegung vor 50 Jahren," NEUE KIRCHLICHE ZEITSCHRIFT 38 (1927), 663-702 trace the influence of Smith, and the Brighton and Oxford meetings. Fleisch's articles in DIE RELIGION IN GESCHICHTE UND GEGENWART, 2nd ed., on Mahan, Finney, Smith and various other holiness leaders and themes are significant.

Smith's efforts are summarized in Fr. Winkler, "Robert Pearsall Smith und der Perfectionismus," BIBLISCHE ZEIT- UND STREITFRAGEN ZUR AUFKLARUNG DES GEBILDETEN 9 (1914), 401-422

and by B. B. Warfield, *PERFECTIONISM*, II, 503 ff. On German Methodism, see H. Brandenburg, "Heiligungsbewegung," *DIE RELIGION IN GESCHICHTE UND GEGENWART*, III (3rd ed.; Tübingen: Mohr, 1959), 182, Paul F. Douglass, *THE STORY OF GERMAN METHODISM: BIOGRAPHY OF AN IMMIGRANT SOUL* (New York: Methodist Book Concern, 1939), and A. L. Drummond, *GERMAN PROTESTANTISM SINCE LUTHER* (London: Epworth Pr., 1951).

The movement in Germany which resulted from the holiness revival has been chronicled by A. L. Drummond, H. Brandenburg, and Paul F. Douglass as well as L. Tiesmayer, "Was jeder-man von der christlichen Gemeinschaftsbewegung in Deutschland wissen muss," *DIE RELIGION IN GESCHICHTE UND GEGENWART*, II (2nd ed.; Tübingen: Mohr, 1928), 1751-1752, which includes significant bibliography. Adbel R. Wentz, *GERMANY'S MODERN PIETISTIC MOVEMENT* (n.p.: n.n., n.d.), is excellent as is P. Fleisch, *DIE MODERNE GEMEINSCHAFTBEWEGUNG IN DEUTSCHLAND: EIN VERSUCH, DIESELBE NACH IHREN URSPRUENGEN DARZUSTELLEN UND ZU WÜRDIGEN* (Leipzig: H. G. Wallman, 1903).

Theodor Jellinghaus, Otto Stockmayer and Heinrich Rappard were the most influential theologians of the movement. They and others are featured in Ernst Modersohn, *MEN OF REVIVAL IN GERMANY* (Frankfort am Main: Harold Pub., n.d.), a popular exposition of the lives of these men. Otto Stockmayer was often on the platform at Keswick, and his *SANCTIFIED ONES* (New York: n.n., 1904?), had at least two editions. Important in Switzerland and Germany were *DIE GNADE IST ERSCHIENEN* (München: Anker, 1949), *ABRAHAM, DER VATER DER GLÄUBIGEN* (Basel: Brunnen, 1943), and *DIE GABE DES HEILIGEN GEISTES* (Basel: n.n., 1898). See also J. C. Pollock, *THE KESWICK STORY*, passim, and *DIE RELIGION IN GESCHICHTE UND GEGENWART*, VI (3rd ed.; Tübingen: Mohr, 1962), 386, regarding Stockmayer's life and influence. Sev-

eral of Stockmayer's addresses were edited by T. D. H. Battersby, REMINISCENCES OF THE KESWICK CONVENTION, ADDRESSES OF PASTOR STOCKMAYER AT THE KESWICK CONVENTION (London: S. W. Partridge, 1879), and in Stockmayer's, THE BODY OF CHRIST AND ITS DIVINE ARCHITECT (London: J. Snow, 1899).

Theodor Jellinghaus, though less well known in England and America, was a missionary, pastor, theologian, and biblical expositor, DER BRIEF PAULI AN DIE RÖMER (Auslegung des Neuen Testaments, 6, Berlin: Thormann & Goetsch, 1903). His DAS VÖLLIGE, GEGENWÄRTIGE HEIL DURCH CHRISTUM (Berlin: Prochnow, 1880; 4th ed. Basel: Kober, Spittlers, 1898), outlined a rather "Keswickian" understanding of holiness, avoiding the "perfectionist" persuasion of American Methodism. PHILADELPHIA, a periodical published by the Committee for the Cultivation of Christian Fellowship and Evangelical Piety, was edited with considerable success by Jellinghaus and served as a cohesive element for the rapidly growing movement.

Foreign Missions. The Keswick Convention has been an influential force in Christian missions, not so much in terms of direct personal support as in the inspiring of persons to enter foreign missionary service and in motivating the wealthier churchmen of Britain to promote and provide for missions. For material relating to this concern see John Pollock, "Keswick Convention," in CONCISE DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN WORLD MISSION, ed. Stephen Neill (Nashville: Abingdon, 1971), p. 322. More helpful is the well-indexed HISTORY OF THE CHURCH MISSIONARY SOCIETY: ITS ENVIRONMENT, ITS MEN AND ITS WORK, by Eugene Stock, Vol. III (London: Church Missionary Society, 1899). This volume is a gold mine of data regarding the development of missionary concern within the Convention leading to the "Missionary Meetings," under the leadership of Reginald Radcliffe, and to the eventual sending

of Convention missionaries. The first of these was Amy Carmichael, whose story has been told by Frank Houghton, AMY CARMICHAEL OF DOHNAVUR: THE STORY OF A LOVER AND HER BELOVED (London: S.P.C.K., 1953).

James Hudson Taylor was a key figure in Keswick missions. The China Inland Mission, which he founded, had many contacts with the Convention and drew support from it. Taylor's principal biographers were his son and daughter-in-law, Dr. and Mrs. (Frederick) Howard Taylor. J. HUDSON TAYLOR, FOUNDER OF THE CHINA INLAND MISSION (Chicago: Moody, 1965), was abridged by Phyllis Thompson from the earlier two volume life, HUDSON TAYLOR IN EARLY YEARS: THE GROWTH OF A SOUL and HUDSON TAYLOR AND THE CHINA INLAND MISSION: THE GROWTH OF A WORK OF GOD (London: Morgan & Scott, 1911-1918), both of which have gone through several editions. The Howard Taylors also wrote HUDSON TAYLOR'S SPIRITUAL SECRET (London: China Inland Mission, 1932). More popular are Marshall Broomhall, HUDSON TAYLOR, THE MAN WHO BELIEVED GOD (London: China Inland Mission, 1929), and J. C. Pollock, HUDSON TAYLOR AND MARIA: PIONEERS IN CHINA (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1962). Important is M. Geraldine Guinness, (Mrs. F. H. Taylor) THE STORY OF THE CHINA INLAND MISSION, 2 vols. (London: Morgan & Scott, 1893-94).

From Taylor's own hand are A RETROSPECT (London: Morgan, 1894), and UNION AND COMMUNION: OR THOUGHTS ON THE SONG OF SOLOMON (London: Morgan & Scott, 1894), the latter first printed in CHINA'S MILLIONS. The 1914 edition contains a foreword by J. Stuart Holden.

C. G. Moore was with Taylor in China before being forced to return to England by his wife's illness. He then became the unidentified editor of LIFE OF FAITH and was thereby responsible for the increased mission focus of the periodical. Fred Mitchell, for some

time Home Director of The China Inland Mission, became chairperson of the Keswick Convention. Mitchell's biographer is Phyllis Thompson, CLIMBING ON TRACK: A BIOGRAPHY OF FRED MITCHELL (London: China Inland Mission, 1953).

Other accounts by men involved in the first beginnings of missionary awareness at Keswick were contributed to THE KESWICK CONVENTION, edited by Charles F. Harford (London: Marshall Bros., 1907). Eugene Stock contributed an essay entitled, "The Missionary Element," J. H. Battersby, "The Keswick Mission Council," and F. B. Meyer and Charles Inwood, "In Other Lands," the latter being a record of tours by Keswick speakers to lend spiritual and emotional support to missionaries on the field. Steven Barabas, SO GREAT SALVATION, is a significant source. See also John Pollock, THE KESWICK STORY (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1964), for a popular account.

Additional material must be ferreted from biographies such as TEMPLE GAIRDNER OF CAIRO (London: S.P.C.K., 1930), by Constance Padwick; Archibald M. Hay, CHARLES INWOOD, HIS MINISTRY AND ITS SECRET (London: Marshall, 1929), and W. R. Wheeler, A MAN SENT FROM GOD: A BIOGRAPHY OF ROBERT E. SPEER<sup>25</sup> (Westwood, N.J.: Revell, 1956).

---

25. Robert Elliott Speer, a member of the Student Volunteer movement (See Neill, ed., CONCISE DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN WORLD MISSION [Nashville: Abingdon, 1971], pp. 571-572), and later senior secretary of the Board of Foreign Missions of the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A., was a popular speaker at Keswick and at Moody's Northfield, Winona Lake, Indiana, and other "Keswick" conventions. A prolific author, he contributed to WINONA ECHOES, NORTHFIELD ECHOES and

The Missionary concerns are reflected today by the many mission groups who recruit and advertise at the Convention, by records of missionary meetings published in the annual, THE KESWICK WEEK, and by the multitude of mission oriented articles appearing in the weekly LIFE OF FAITH.

Conventions Abroad. LIFE OF FAITH continuously reports on "Keswick" conventions throughout the world. John Pollock, THE KESWICK STORY (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1964), p. 97, note 3, gives a list of several "offshoots" with date of origin but is not complete. SCOTLAND'S KESWICK: SKETCHES AND REMINISCENCES (London: Marshall Bros., 1917), by Norman C. Macfarlane chronicles the Convention there. THE MID-AMERICA KESWICK WEEK, VITAL MESSAGES BY NINE CONTEMPORARY CHRISTIAN LEADERS (Westwood, N.J.: Revell, 1960), is the only published record of the meetings held at Moody Memorial Church, Chicago since 1954. No registry of "Keswick" camps or conventions has been found.

---

THE FUNDAMENTALS (Vol. 3, 61-75; 12, 64-84). His books focused on missions, ecclesiastical unity and the internal life. See especially the often reprinted, THE MARKS OF A MAN; OR, THE ESSENTIALS OF CHRISTIAN CHARACTER (Cincinnati: Jennings & Graham, 1907); JESUS AND OUR HUMAN PROBLEMS (N.Y.: Revell, 1946), dealing with the relationship between Christ and sin; THE MEANING OF CHRIST TO ME (N.Y.: Revell, 1936), an exposition based on the life of Christ; and THE FINALITY OF JESUS CHRIST (N.Y.: Revell, 1933), given originally as the L.P. Stone Lectures at Princeton Theological Seminary, 1932-1933 and The Gay Lectures at the Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1932-1933. See also K. S. Latour-ette, "Speer, Robert E." in Neill, CONCISE DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN WORLD MISSION, pp. 565-566.

The Keswick Movement began almost immediately to influence the American religious scene. Keswick had received its impetus from American revivalism via the Robert Pearsall Smiths, W. E. Boardman, Asa Mahan, Amanda Smith and A. T. Pierson. These men and women were of the perfectionist persuasion and leaned more toward Arminian than toward Calvinistic theological categories regarding Christian spirituality. They were oriented toward thinking in "crisis" language. Literature and folklore are the recorders of the excesses engendered.

The British leaders, mainly Anglican, had a moderating influence on religious crisis enthusiasm (see below, Theological Distinctives). Moody,<sup>26</sup> who had been perceived as a co-

---

26. Dwight Lyman Moody was the subject of biographies by two of his sons. William R. Moody, *THE LIFE OF DWIGHT L. MOODY* (N.Y.: Revell, 1900), provided "The Official Authorized Version," complete with tributes by F. B. Meyer and G. Campbell Morgan. Paul D. Moody, *MY FATHER; AN INTIMATE PORTRAIT OF DWIGHT MOODY* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1938), gives a picture of Moody as the warm, lovable, vital human being, which balances the rather stiff quaint man portrayed in his *THE SHORTER LIFE OF D. L. MOODY* (Chicago: Bible Institute Colportage Association, 1900). Accounts of Moody's work in Europe may be found in the ponderous dusty chronicles of John Hall, *THE AMERICAN EVANGELISTS, D. L. MOODY AND IRA D. SANKEY, IN GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND* (N.Y.: Dodd & Mead, 1875), as well as in Edgar Johnson Goodspeed, *A FULL HISTORY OF THE WONDERFUL CAREER OF MOODY AND SANKEY, IN GREAT BRITAIN AND AMERICA . . .* (N.Y.: Henry S. Goodspeed, 1876).

More recently, J. C. Pollock, *MOODY: A BIOGRAPHICAL PORTRAIT OF THE PACESETTER IN MOD-*



laborer in revival by Smith, was quick to transport the restrained spiritual expression of Keswick back to his famed Northfield Conferences and to what became Moody Bible Institute in Chicago.<sup>27</sup> (Go to next page)

---

ERN MASS EVANGELISM (N.Y.: Macmillan, 1963), the British edition entitled, MOODY WITHOUT SANKEY; A NEW BIOGRAPHICAL PORTRAIT (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1963), has rewritten the story of Moody's life, but the lack of documentation makes it of little value for research.

James F. Findlay's Ph.D. thesis at the University of Chicago, published as DWIGHT L. MOODY, AMERICAN EVANGELIST, 1837-1899 (Chicago: University of Chicago, 1969), is by far the best work available on Moody. Also indispensable is Wilbur M. Smith, AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF D.L. MOODY (Chicago: Moody, 1948). With the inevitable omissions that plague such an effort, it is carefully done, including previously unpublished materials.

Of particular interest for the discussion of Holiness Movement-Keswick relations is the "sanctification" experience of D. L. Moody alluded to in his own writings and discussed by Sarah A. Cooke, a Free Methodist layperson, in THE HANDMAIDEN OF THE LORD; OR, WAYSIDE SKETCHES (Chicago: Arnold, 1896), revised and enlarged as WAYSIDE SKETCHES; OR, THE HANDMAIDEN OF THE LORD (Grand Rapids: Shaw, n.d.). Moody's experience was also discussed several times by Asa Mahan in DIVINE LIFE.

27. Moody Bible Institute of Chicago, founded circa 1886, has been thoroughly studied by Gene A. Getz, MBI; THE STORY OF MOODY BIBLE INSTITUTE (Chicago: Moody, 1969). A careful effort is made to chronicle the outreach as well as the history of the institu-

R. A. Torrey,<sup>28</sup> Moody's choice for Director of Chicago Bible Institute, spoke at Keswick; Moody invited A.T. Pierson, H.W. Webb-Peploe,<sup>29</sup>

---

tion. The extensive bibliography, pp. 356-369, must serve as a beginning for any additional research.

28. Reuben Archer Torrey had a varied career as evangelist, author, and Bible School leader. Apparently no extensive critical biographical examination of Torrey's contribution has been made. John Kennedy Maclean published three small volumes: TORREY AND ALEXANDER, THE STORY OF THEIR LIVES (London: Partridge, 1905), TRIUMPHANT EVANGELISM: THE THREE YEARS' MISSIONS OF DR. TORREY AND MR. ALEXANDER IN GREAT BRITAIN AND IRELAND (London: Marshall Bros., 1905), and UNDER TWO MASTERS: THE STORY OF JACOBY, DR. TORREY'S ASSISTANT (London: Marshall Bros., 1905). All are popular and devotional but not very helpful for understanding the man himself. Torrey was particularly influential in combining the concern for personal holiness with millenarian concerns. THE BAPTISM WITH THE HOLY SPIRIT (N.Y.: Revell, 1895), and THE FUNDAMENTAL DOCTRINES OF THE CHRISTIAN FAITH (N.Y.: Doran, 1918), were his most important books. An able tractarian, he focused more and more on eschatology; e.g., THE RETURN OF THE LORD JESUS; THE KEY TO THE SCRIPTURE, AND THE SOLUTION OF ALL OUR POLITICAL AND SOCIAL PROBLEMS; OR, THE GOLDEN AGE THAT IS SOON COMING TO THE EARTH (Los Angeles: Bible Institute of L.A., 1913). Several of Torrey's sermons and the tract, "Why God Used D. L. Moody," were often printed in holiness journals.

29. H. W. Webb-Peploe was a popular preacher at Keswick and Northfield. No major biography has been written. Barabas, SO GREAT

---

SALVATION, pp. 165-169, is the most extensive "vita." Most of his writings are from various convention addresses. Most influential were his sermons, THE VICTORIOUS LIFE, and THE LIFE OF PRIVILEGE: POSSESSION, PEACE, AND POWER (London: Nisbet, 1896, 1897). For additional bibliography see Jones, A GUIDE TO THE STUDY OF THE HOLINESS MOVEMENT.

30. F. B. Meyer, "the best known Baptist clergyman of his day" (Barabas, SO GREAT SALVATION, p. 182), was a vigorous proponent of the Keswick message. Barabas (ibid., p. 186) observes, "It is doubtful whether any other Keswick leader ever did more than Dr. Meyer to make the distinctive Keswick message known throughout the world." His life story by W. Y. Fullerton, F. B. MEYER: A BIOGRAPHY (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1929), is a perceptive, highly readable account. M. Jennie Street, F. B. MEYER: HIS LIFE AND WORK (London: S. W. Partridge, 1902), is a more popular account. See also Barabas, SO GREAT SALVATION, pp. 182-186. The story of his ministry at Leicester is found in F. B. Meyer, THE BELLS OF IS; OR, VOICES OF HUMAN NEED AND SORROW (London: Morgan & Scott, 1894). Here more than anywhere, the genius of Meyer is revealed. An extensive listing of his writings may be found in the advertisements at the back of the book! A more traditional list, however, with incomplete bibliographic information and short title may be found in chapter 24 of Fullerton.

31. Andrew Murray, who spoke at "Keswick" meetings in America and England, spoke most enduringly from his parish in South Africa through the pages of the SOUTH AFRICAN PIONEER (see p. 82) and his often reprinted numerous books, pamphlets, and tracts. Of spe-

bell Morgan<sup>32</sup> to speak at Northfield. All were prominent Keswick speakers. When in 1892 Moody was on an overseas crusade, A. J. Gordon, Keswick speaker and Boston pastor,

---

cial significance are: THE SPIRIT OF CHRIST: THOUGHTS ON THE INDWELLING OF THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE BELIEVER AND THE CHURCH (London: Nisbet, 1888; the American ed. of circa 1904 has a biographical statement reprinted from the SOUTH AFRICAN PIONEER); BACK TO PENTECOST: THE FULFILLMENT OF "THE PROMISE OF THE FATHER" (ACTS 1:4) (London: Oliphants, 1918); and HOLY IN CHRIST: THOUGHTS ON THE CALLING OF GOD'S CHILDREN TO BE HOLY AS HE IS HOLY, and THE TWO COVENANTS AND THE SECOND BLESSING (London: Nisbet, 1888, 1889), in which are set forth his concept of sanctification.

W. M. Douglas has summarized Murray's teaching in ANDREW MURRAY AND HIS MESSAGE: ONE OF GOD'S CHOICE SAINTS (London: Oliphants, 1926); reprinted with some deletions, Fort Washington, Pa.: Christian Literature Crusade, 1957. J. DuPlessis, THE LIFE OF ANDREW MURRAY OF SOUTH AFRICA (London: Marshall Bros., 1919), is a comparatively well written biography. A valuable bibliography, unfortunately abbreviated, forms Appendix B, pp. 526-535. The index is helpfully complete.

32. G. Campbell Morgan as a young man was rejected for ordination by the Wesleyan Methodists. He became a popular and frequent speaker both at Keswick and at Moody's Northfield Conferences. John Harries, G. CAMPBELL MORGAN, THE MAN AND HIS MINISTRY (1930), is the best biography. Another, by his daughter-in-law, Jill Morgan, is based on his personal papers: A MAN OF THE WORD: LIFE OF G. CAMPBELL MORGAN (1951). The style, however, is awkward. THIS WAS HIS FAITH: THE EXPOSITORY LETTERS OF G. CAMPBELL MORGAN (1952), contains excerpts, topically

was left in charge of the meetings. Ernest R. Sandeen,<sup>33</sup> THE ROOTS OF FUNDAMENTALISM: BRITISH AND AMERICAN MILLENARIANISM, 1800-1930 (Chicago: University of Chicago, 1970), suggests that these meetings, and especially F. B. Meyer, were influential in the adoption of a Keswickian concern for a higher Christian life by the millenarians who were Calvinistic and conservative.

By 1913, an American Keswick Conference was underway. Three volumes in particular are of importance: VICTORY IN CHRIST: A REPORT OF PRINCETON CONFERENCE 1916 (Philadelphia: Board of Managers of Princeton Conf., 1916); THE VICTORIOUS LIFE: MESSAGES FROM THE SUMMER CONFERENCES AT WHITTIER, CALIFORNIA, JUNE; PRINCETON, NEW JERSEY, JULY; CEDAR LAKE, INDIANA, AUGUST; INCLUDING ALSO SOME MESSAGES FROM THE 1917 CONFERENCE AT PRINCETON AND OTHER MATERIAL (Philadelphia: Board of Managers of Victorious Life Conf., 1918), and THE VICTORIOUS CHRIST: MESSAGES FROM CONFERENCES HELD BY THE VICTORIOUS LIFE TESTIMONY IN 1922 (Philadelphia: Sunday School Times, 1923). In the last volume is a brief historical

---

arranged. No data is included as to occasion, recipient, etc. All the above were published by Revell; each contains an incomplete list of his works. Harold Murray, G. CAMPBELL MORGAN, BIBLE TEACHER: A SKETCH OF THE GREAT EXPOSITOR AND EVANGELIST (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1938), is a study on an important facet of Morgan's life.

33. Pp. 176-181, Sandeen, ROOTS OF FUNDAMENTALISM is crucial for an understanding of the deeper life movements within the U.S. With careful precision he places the men and issues in meaningful perspective. See especially Chapter 6, "The Prophecy and Bible Conference Movement."

statement, "The Hour for America's Keswick" pps. 249-252, which ends in a plea for funds to support the new camp at Keswick, New Jersey.

The American Holiness Movement. While the Calvinistic branch of the deeper life movement was having considerable success in America, the Arminian branch was quickly losing its influence within Methodism and was being threatened by the successes of Pentecostalism, particularly in the South.<sup>34</sup> The sibling rivalry which developed has led to a hardening of both theological alternatives and to mutual caricature.

---

34. See C. E. Jones, PERFECTIONIST PERSUASION: THE HOLINESS MOVEMENT IN AMERICAN METHODISM 1867-1936, A.T.L.A. Monograph Series, 5 (Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow, 1975). This superb book, based upon the heretofore mentioned, "Perfectionist Persuasion: A Social Profile of the National Holiness Movement Within American Methodism, 1867-1936" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Wisconsin, 1968), is available from University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Mich., number 68-0, 083). He discusses the origins of Nazarene, Free Methodist, Wesleyan, et al; churches. Vinson Synan, THE HOLINESS-PENTECOSTAL MOVEMENT IN THE UNITED STATES (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1971), traces Pentecostal incursions in the American Holiness Movement. Additional bibliographic material necessary to understand this period may be found in the first two volumes of "Occasional Bibliographic Papers of the B. L. Fisher Library": Donald W. Dayton, THE AMERICAN HOLINESS MOVEMENT: A BIBLIOGRAPHIC INTRODUCTION, now undergoing substantial revision, and David W. Faupel, THE AMERICAN PENTECOSTAL MOVEMENT: A BIBLIOGRAPHIC ESSAY (Wilmore, Kentucky, Asbury Theological Seminary, 1971-1972).

The Holiness-Keswick debate focused on two issues: original sin and the nature of sanctification. Holiness Movement clergy in the Methodist-Wesleyan context emphasized the instantaneous removal of original sin by an instantaneous act of grace; viz, entire sanctification. Keswick maintained a Reformed view of sin and a gradual process of sanctification. The categories became "eradicationist" (Keswick term for the Holiness position) versus "suppressionist" (Holiness Movement term for the Keswick position). Suppression described the Keswickian goal of "uniform sustained victory over known sin." There was agreement regarding the need for sanctification. The difference arose regarding its meaning for the believer. It has been suggested that Asa Mahan dropped out of the Keswick Convention after the first three; he reportedly observed at Brighton, "It doesn't go deep enough."

W. B. Godbey,<sup>35</sup> radical Holiness Movement preacher, teacher, and influential pamphleteer, was one of the first to rise to the attack. KESWICKISM (Louisville, Ky.: Pentecostal Publishing House, n.d.), discusses the absoluteness of the destruction of sin, then moves to an account of "My Keswickal Convention" in Madras, India. He comments on the lack of spiritual power on the part of those in attendance, observing:

...The truth of the matter is, their

---

35. On William B. Godbey see his AUTOBIOGRAPHY (Cincinnati: God's Revivalist Office, 1909), and his comments a year before his death, HAPPY NONAGENARIAN (Zarephath, N.J.: Pillar of Fire, 1919). For additional bibliography, though not complete, see Jones, A GUIDE TO THE STUDY OF THE HOLINESS MOVEMENT. A critical biography has not been published.

experience is simply a good case of regeneration, as they only claim to have sin suppressed and kept down by grace in a subjugated state, so that it does not break out and commit actual transgression. (p. 48)...Keswickism is a deficiency rather than a heresy ... (p. 59)...Keswickism as a normal consequence breaks down, because the Holy Ghost will not abide, while old Adam remains in the heart" (p. 61).

About 1910, A. M. Hills,<sup>36</sup> a Nazarene educator and writer, wrote *SCRIPTURAL HOLINESS AND KESWICK TEACHING COMPARED* (Manchester: Star Hall, n.d.), which for years has been the standard Holiness Movement critique of the Keswick Movement. Part I presents "Scriptural Holiness Teaching," arguing for a "second blessing" and "the eradication of carnality," and describing the reception and continuance in this "life of blessing" which is "the longing of devout souls." Part II, "A Review of Keswick Teaching," although undocumented, features quotations from Keswick speakers as reported in *KESWICK WEEK*. He commends Keswick teachers for attempting to lift the moral tone of the era, but notes that "Keswick teachers are not consistent with themselves, nor in agreement with each other," that their teaching is "painfully indistinct," that "much of what these preachers call holi-

---

36. Aaron Merritt Hills (1848-1935) supplied a short autobiographical statement to *PENTECOSTAL MESSENGERS* (Cincinnati: M. W. Knapp, 1898), and the *FULL SALVATION QUARTERLY*, Vol. 5 (1899?). See also H. O. Wiley, "Dr. A. M. Hills," *HERALD OF HOLINESS*, Vol. 40 (July 2, 1951), p. 388, and James McGraw, "The Preaching of A. M. Hills," *PREACHER'S MAGAZINE*, Vol. 33, No. 2 (1958), p.6-8.



ness is only regeneration," and that they maintain an "unsound philosophy about self, and the nature of flesh and depravity." Hills' massive analysis lacks coherency, the logic is often circular, and he clearly does not understand the Keswick theological method and position. He furnishes a caricature rather than an exposé of Keswickian teaching.

H. A. Baldwin,<sup>37</sup> a Free Methodist<sup>38</sup> pastor and writer, published a curious little volume, OBJECTIONS TO ENTIRE SANCTIFICATION CONSIDERED (Pittsburgh: Published for the Author, 1911), containing short refutations to sixteen "Objections." "Keswickism" is described as "one of the most dangerous enemies of the experience of holiness...for they give us to understand that such a thing as the entire eradication of the carnal nature from the soul is an impossibility in this world" (p. 11). Quoting the famed Daniel Steele, Baldwin argues the Holiness Movement case on the radical nature of New Testament language regarding sanctification and the eradication of the carnal nature, but offers the ameliorating observation that only God knows the heart of man!

The Keswickian perspective was asserted by

---

37. Harmon Allen Baldwin, OBJECTIONS TO ENTIRE-SANCTIFICATION CONSIDERED has recently been reprinted by H. E. Schmul in HOLINESS CLASSICS, NO. I. (Titusville, Pa.: The Allegheny Wesleyan Methodist Connection, 1973). Refer to C. E. Jones for biographical and bibliographical data currently available.

38. For bibliographical direction on the Free Methodist Church, see Donald W. Dayton, THE AMERICAN HOLINESS MOVEMENT, A BIBLIOGRAPHIC INTRODUCTION and C. E. Jones, A GUIDE TO THE STUDY OF THE HOLINESS MOVEMENT.

the indefatigable H. A. Ironside<sup>39</sup> in the often reprinted HOLINESS, THE FALSE AND THE TRUE (New York: Loizeaux Brothers, 1912). He chronicles, in fiercely polemical fashion, his early frustrations as a member of the Salvation Army,<sup>40</sup> and attacks the level of spirituality within the Holiness Movement as a unit. Moving from the autobiographical to the doctrinal, Ironside argues for a progressive view of sanctification whereby the Christian comes to live victoriously over temptation and doubt: "All efforts to attain sinless perfection in this world can only end in failure," (p. 132). "Only as one learns to refuse everything that is of the flesh, and finds everything in Christ, will...be enjoyed a life lived in fellowship with God" (p. 133).

Henry E. Brockett, SCRIPTURAL FREEDOM FROM SIN: A DEFENSE OF THE PRECIOUS TRUTH OF ENTIRE SANCTIFICATION BY FAITH AND AN EXAMINATION OF THE DOCTRINE OF "THE TWO NATURES" (Kansas City, Mo.: Nazarene, 1941), is primarily a critique of Ironside's polemic. Restating the classical American perfectionist doctrine of entire sanctification, he relies heavily upon A. M. Hills, SCRIPTURAL HOLINESS AND KESWICK TEACHING COMPARED.

The controversy continued, often implicitly, in the pulpits and periodicals of both per-

---

39. H. A. Ironside was a powerful American expositor and teacher. Closely identified with the American deeper life movement, he was a frequent "Bible Camp" speaker and for nineteen years, 1930-1948, was pastor of Moody Memorial Church (THE MOODY CHURCH STORY, n.d., n.p., 20 pps.), Chicago, the "campus" church of Moody Bible Institute.

40. For bibliographical direction on The Salvation Army, see below under "Bibliography." Dayton and Jones are particularly helpful.

spectives, although little of a scholarly nature was published until the 1960's, when the Holiness Movement began to wrestle with its identity, theologically and historically. Papers prepared originally for a National Holiness Association study group included George E. Failing, "Developments in Holiness Theology after Wesley" and Everett L. Cattell, "An Appraisal of the Keswick and Wesleyan Contemporary Positions," published as INSIGHTS INTO HOLINESS, compiled by Kenneth Geiger (Kansas City, Mo.: Beacon Hill, 1962). Both papers constitute cautious attempts to understand the relationship between Keswick and Holiness alternatives. Another of these papers was presented by W. Ralph Thompson to the Wesleyan Theological Society as "An Appraisal of the Keswick and Wesleyan Contemporary Positions," WESLEYAN THEOLOGICAL JOURNAL Vol. 1 (1966), p. 11-20. Thompson is more polemic but encourages the two sides to learn from each other:

"Keswickism is weak in its scriptural foundation, but strong in its proclamation. Wesleyanism is doctrinally sound, but lacks in zeal and in positive presentation" (pp. 19-20).

More recently, Melvin E. Dieter, a Wesleyan,<sup>41</sup> has investigated the origins of the Keswick Movement, the early years of the subsequent revival and efforts at institutionalization within the various expressions of "Revivalism." Dieter presents by far the most balanced scholarly analysis from within the Holiness Movement.

The American Pentecostal Movement. Both W. B.

---

41. For material relevant to The Wesleyan Church, see below: "Bibliography." Dayton and Dieter are especially helpful.

Godbey and A. M. Hills, who polemicized contra a Keswickian position, also lifted their pens to refute Pentecostalism.<sup>42</sup> David W. Faupel, THE AMERICAN PENTECOSTAL MOVEMENT, A BIBLIOGRAPHICAL ESSAY ("Occasional Bibliographic Papers of the B. L. Fisher Library," 2. Wilmore, Ky.: Asbury Theological Seminary, 1972), originally published in the 1972 SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS: AMERICAN THEOLOGICAL LIBRARY ASSOCIATION, lists fourteen Pentecostal denominations that do not subscribe to a Wesleyan understanding of sanctification, but adopt a Keswickian position. William Menzies of Evangel College, Springfield, Missouri, in 1973 presented to the Society for Pentecostal Studies, Cleveland, Tennessee, a paper entitled, "The Non-Wesleyan Origins of the Pentecostal Movement" (photocopy, 10 pps.). He asserts that Alexander Dowie, A. B. Simpson, founder of the Christian and Missionary Alliance and A. J. Gordon were influential in the promotion of Keswick doctrines. He details (pages 5-9) the subsequent controversy between Wesleyan and Keswickian types of holiness doctrine within Pentecostal groups. Melvin Dieter read a paper before the Society for Pentecostal Studies, Cleveland, Tennessee, 1973, "Wesleyan-Holiness Aspects of Pentecostal Origins: As Mediated through the Nineteenth Century Holiness Revivals" (30 pps. photocopy), in which he traces the influence of the Holiness Movement which, as noted above, also provided stimulus for the Keswick Convention. Menzies' and Dieter's papers

---

42. W. B. Godbey, SPIRITUAL GIFTS AND GRACES (Cincinnati: God's Revivalist Office, 1895), defines tongues as languages and encourages all to seek this "gift." Later, he wrote the acidic TONGUE MOVEMENT, SATANIC (Zarephath, N.J.: Pillar of Fire, 1918). A. M. Hills wrote THE TONGUES MOVEMENT (Manchester, Eng.: Star Hall, 1910), to refute the claims of the burgeoning Pentecostalism.

will soon be more readily available in a volume by Logos Press containing papers presented to the Society for Pentecostal Studies in 1972. The papers focus around the theme, "Aspects of Pentecostal Origins."

The Christian and Missionary Alliance. Note: Publications mentioned in the following paragraphs, except where otherwise indicated, were published by the Christian Alliance, New York, and currently by its successor, Christian Publications, Harrisburg, Pa. In 1974 the International Headquarters of the C. & M. A. was moved from New York City to Upper Nyack, New York. The Christian and Missionary Alliance originated in the 1880's under the direction of A. B. Simpson, pastor of 13th Street Presbyterian Church in New York City.<sup>43</sup> Frustrated in ministry and plagued by illness, he was influenced by the faith healing and millenarian hopes of A. J. Gordon,<sup>44</sup> THE MIN-

---

43. From 1887-1897 the Christian Alliance was Simpson's domestic association, and The International Missionary Alliance was devoted to foreign missions. The "merger" produced the C. & M. A.

44. Adoniram Judson Gordon (1836-1895) was an influential Baptist in America and a leader of the millenarian movement (Sandeen, THE ROOTS OF FUNDAMENTALISM, passim). He exercised much influence in the early synthesis of the C. & M. A., primarily through the book mentioned above and through his often reprinted THE MINISTRY OF THE SPIRIT, with an introduction by F. B. Meyer (Philadelphia: American Baptist Pub. Soc., 1894). Also important is THE TWOFOLD LIFE: OR, CHRIST'S WORK FOR US, AND CHRIST'S WORK IN US (Boston: H. Gannett, 1883), a study in the attainment of "the abundant life." His autobiography is HOW CHRIST CAME TO CHURCH; THE PASTOR'S DREAM: A SPIRIT-

ISTRY OF HEALING: OR, MIRACLES OF CURE IN ALL AGES (Boston: H. Gannett, 1882), and W. E. Boardman (see above, note 13). Concerned for evangelism among the underprivileged both at home and abroad, Simpson withdrew from the Presbyterian Church, founding the new Alliance around the fourfold doctrine of Christ as Saviour, Sanctifier, Healer, and Coming King. Simpson's writings emphasize these concerns: THE FOUR-FOLD GOSPEL (1925), THE FULLNESS OF JESUS; OR CHRISTIAN LIFE IN THE NEW TESTAMENT (1890), LIFE MORE ABUNDANTLY (1912), WALKING IN THE SPIRIT (n.d.), WHOLLY SANCTIFIED (1925), THE GOSPEL OF HEALING (1915), (all of the above are being made available in paperback), THE LORD FOR THE BODY, WITH QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS ON DIVINE HEALING (1925), an enlargement of the earlier THE DISCOVERY OF DIVINE HEALING (1903), THE COMING ONE (1912) and HEAVEN OPENED: OR, EXPOSITIONS OF THE BOOK OF REVELATION (1899).

Simpson's life, chronicled by A. E. Thompson, THE LIFE OF A. B. SIMPSON: WITH SPECIAL CHAPTERS BY PAUL RADER, JAMES M. GRAY, J. GREGORY MANTLE, R. H. GLOVER, KENNETH MACKENZIE, F. H. SENFT, AND W. M. TURNBULL (1920), was revised as A. B. SIMPSON: HIS LIFE AND WORK (1939). A. W. Tozer, WINGSPREAD: ALBERT B. SIMPSON, A STUDY IN SPIRITUAL ALTITUDE (Centenary ed., 1943), is an exposition of his life.

Studies of the historical development of the Christian and Missionary Alliance are George P. Pardington, TWENTY-FIVE WONDERFUL YEARS, 1889-1914: A POPULAR SKETCH OF THE CHRISTIAN

---

UAL AUTOBIOGRAPHY, BY A. J. GORDON...WITH THE LIFE-STORY, AND THE DREAM AS INTERPRETING THE MAN, BY A. T. PIERSON (Philadelphia: Amer. Baptist Pub. Soc., 1895). His son, Ernest B. Gordon, wrote ADONIRAM JUDSON GORDON, A BIOGRAPHY (New York: Revell, 1896).

AND MISSIONARY ALLIANCE (1914), and AFTER FIFTY YEARS: A RECORD OF GOD'S WORKING THROUGH THE CHRISTIAN AND MISSIONARY ALLIANCE, by R. B. Ekvall et al. (1939). Samuel J. Stoesz, UNDERSTANDING MY CHURCH (1968), is intended as a manual for church members and is a good survey of history, doctrine and polity, unfortunately without bibliography. J. H. Hunter's 75th anniversary volume was devoted to a study of mission work, BESIDE ALL WATERS; THE STORY OF SEVENTY-FIVE YEARS OF WORLD-WIDE MINISTRY: THE CHRISTIAN AND MISSIONARY ALLIANCE (1964). Mission work is also chronicled in MISSIONARY ATLAS: A MANUAL OF THE FOREIGN WORK OF THE CHRISTIAN AND MISSIONARY ALLIANCE, (4th ed., 1964; 1st ed. 1936).

The Christian and Missionary Alliance has produced significant missionary policy material; for example, Louis L. King, "A Presentation of the Indigenous Church Policy of the Christian and Missionary Alliance" (photocopy 17 pps., 1961?). They sponsored and published the REPORT OF PROCEEDINGS of the Afro-Asia Alliance Literature Conference, April, 1963 (1964), hoping to strengthen indigenous work. A rich heritage of missionary biography includes Russell T. Hitt, CANNIBAL VALLEY (1962), a story of Dutch New Guinea, and James C. Hefley, BY LIFE OR BY DEATH (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1969), about missionary efforts in Indo-China.

The most influential theologian of the Christian and Missionary Alliance has been George P. Pardington, THE CRISIS OF THE DEEPER LIFE<sup>45</sup> (1906), who defined the Keswick orientation toward sanctification to be adopted by the denomination. With his conciliatory language,

---

45. Pardington, THE CRISIS OF THE DEEPER LIFE, along with several volumes by A. W. Tozer have been reprinted in paperback by Christian Pub., Harrisburg, Pa.

the Christian and Missionary Alliance has been able to maintain close relationship with the American Holiness Movement, although it has remained outside the orb of the National Holiness Association. It is particularly impressive that the Christian and Missionary Alliance did not develop a hostile polemic contra Pentecostalism as did the Holiness Movement, but maintains an attitude of "seek not, forbid not" to this day. A. W. Tozer, Oswald J. Smith, and of course, A. B. Simpson have been the important Christian and Missionary Alliance expositors. For additional bibliography see C. E. Jones, A GUIDE TO THE STUDY OF THE HOLINESS MOVEMENT, which contains the most complete bibliography to date on the Christian and Missionary Alliance.

#### LITERATURE OF KESWICK

The literature produced under the impetus of the Keswick Movement falls into three overlapping categories: theological, biblical, and devotional studies. With regard to this extensive corpus of literature, several problems arise. First, the Keswick Convention in England has never defined a precise theological perspective. Rather, "Keswick theology" tends to revolve around a few "guiding lights" who, in each generation, have managed to keep on a track consistent with the heritage of the movement. Throughout, the concern has been for "practical holiness," for the experience of the power of God within the life of the believer. There is no creedal statement, merely a rather remarkable consensus of theological orientation. It is very different in America. The American "Keswick" people bought quickly and deeply into the Millenarian-Fundamentalist strictness of doctrine, while attempting to maintain the British experiential emphasis. R. A. Torrey, A. T. Pierson, H. A. Ironside and F. B. Meyer were involved in producing THE FUNDAMENTALS (Chicago: Testimony Publishing House, 1910-



1915). R. A. Torrey together with A. C. Dixon and Louis Meyer edited this influential series which continues to express the creed of American fundamentalism. Thus, the representatives of American "Keswick" tend to be more concerned with correct (conservative) thinking than with the experiential aspects of the Christian life. Both American and British Keswickians endeavor to be "based on the Bible."

The method of this portion of the essay is to divide the literature according to its emphases. Theological Studies will present literature which addresses a concern of doctrine, focusing on the issue. Devotional Studies will be considered the work of authors who, in summary or synthetic fashion, devote themselves to explicating Christian spirituality. Biblical Studies involve major expositions, commentaries and Bible study aids.

### Bibliography

The Keswick Convention has not produced institutions which in turn would carefully define what is to be considered "Keswick" or not "Keswick." Keswick has remained a Convention, that is, a loosely associated group concerned with the deeper life, and has generally been ignored by church historians. Thus the state of bibliographic research is sadly lacking. The Keswick Movement is not treated in the various standard bibliographic tools; however, THE BRITISH MUSEUM GENERAL CATALOGUE OF PRINTED BOOKS is somewhat helpful in finding works of a personage associated with the movement. The bibliographic sources which are available have been cited in the preceding section.

### Theological Studies

Keswickian concern for "practical holiness" began with a heavy emphasis on Christian experience, an inheritance left by the crusad-

ing American evangelists. W. E. Boardman whose *THE HIGHER CHRISTIAN LIFE*, and *IN THE POWER OF THE SPIRIT* were influential in Keswick origins, stressed a second crisis experience. Asa Mahan, *THE BAPTISM OF THE HOLY GHOST* (New York: Palmer, 1870), and *SCRIPTURE DOCTRINE OF CHRISTIAN PERFECTION* (Boston: D. S. King, 1839), later published as *CHRISTIAN PERFECTION* (London: F. E. Longley, 1875), emphasized the possibility of immediate attainment of Christian perfection, as did Robert Pearsall Smith, *HOLINESS THROUGH FAITH, LIGHT ON THE WAY OF HOLINESS*. Although he discounted sinless perfection, he retained the experiential and crisis-oriented language.

The resulting excess of religious enthusiasm was problematic for the early Keswick Convention as it sought acceptance for its participants and doctrines within the established church. The American heritage was played down and Keswickians began tracing their heritage to earlier authors (see above, note 4) and especially to Walter Marshall, *THE GOSPEL-MYSTERY OF SANCTIFICATION, OPENED IN SUNDRY PRACTICAL DIRECTIONS: SUITED ESPECIALLY TO THE CASE OF THOSE WHO ARE UNDER THE GUILT AND POWER OF INDWELLING SIN, TO WHICH IS ADDED A SERMON ON JUSTIFICATION* (Glasgow: Duncan and Robertson, 1797), original London edition 1692, edited and reprinted by Andrew Murray under the title, *SANCTIFICATION, OR THE HIGHWAY OF HOLINESS* (London: Nisbet, 1884). Marshall emphasized simplicity of faith and waiting on Christ as requirements for sanctification, and the resultant joy and peace of conscience. This book is devoid of the "religious enthusiasm" and "perfectionism" of the later American writers, and draws heavily upon the Scriptures in explicating sanctification in a winsome nonpolemic manner.

Other competent Keswick leaders developed and re-emphasized this approach to the issue. H. C. G. Moule, *THOUGHTS ON CHRISTIAN SANCTI-*

TY (London: Seeley, 1885), (reprinted by Moody Press, Chicago, n.d.), consisting primarily of sermons delivered to the Cambridge University Church Society, presents a careful exposition of sanctification as self-surrender, and the personal power of "Jesus Christ who lives for me and in me" (p. 93). Moule,<sup>46</sup>

---

46. Handley Carr Glyn Moule, Principal of Ridley Hall, Cambridge and later successor of B. F. Westcott as Bishop of Durham had a much needed stabilizing effect on Keswick. His careful exegetical studies served to keep the Convention from excesses which might have destroyed its effectiveness. His biographers were Keswick men. John Harford Battersby and Frederick Charles Macdonald, *HANDLEY CARR GLYN MOULE, BISHOP OF DURHAM, A BIOGRAPHY* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, n.d. 1922?), is a rather traditional biography based on his letters and papers. John Baird, *THE SPIRITUAL UNFOLDING OF BISHOP H. C. G. MOULE, D.D., AN EXPOSITION* (London: Oliphants, n.d. 1926), is of little value, being primarily an apology for an evangelical perspective. See also the briefer notes in *OXFORD DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN CHURCH*, p. 930; *DICTIONARY OF NATIONAL BIOGRAPHY 1912-1921*, p. 390-391 and Barabas, *SO GREAT SALVATION*, 169-175. A complete list of his works can be found in Battersby and Macdonald. Of primary interest are *JUSTIFYING RIGHTEOUSNESS* (London: Seeley, 1885), *OUTLINES OF CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1889), *VENI CREATOR* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1890), *PHILIPPINIAN STUDIES* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1897), *COLOSSIAN STUDIES* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1898), *EPHESIAN STUDIES* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1900). *NEED AND FULNESS* (London: Marshall Bros., 1895), is a series of six addresses included in the *KESWICK LIBRARY*. *PATIENCE AND COMFORT* (1896) and *CHRIST AND THE CHRISTIAN* (1919) are addresses

through his books, as well as his frequent appearances at the Keswick Convention, wielded a crucial, formative influence on the theological outlook of the Convention.

Alexander Smellie,<sup>47</sup> LIFT UP YOUR HEARTS: FOUR ADDRESSES ON SANCTIFICATION (London: Andrew Melrose, 1915), a volume dedicated to Evan Hopkins, promotes the concept of achieving holiness through quiet surrender of self, holiness which, "though it is perfect, it is being perfected," (p. 65). However, Hopkins, THE LAW OF LIBERTY IN THE SPIRITUAL LIFE (1884), is the first orderly and extensive analysis of the essentials of the Christian life from a Keswickian perspective.

The Keswickian view of sin, first expounded in print by Hopkins, has been given additional exposition in H. C. G. Moule, NEED AND FULLNESS (London: Marshall Bros., 1894), and OUTLINES OF CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1889), which, together with W. H. Griffith Thomas,<sup>48</sup> THE PRINCIPLES OF THEOLO-

---

delivered at Keswick on the subject of the Christian life and subsequently published by Marshall Brothers.

47. Alexander Smellie, the biographer of Evan Henry Hopkins, was a prolific producer of devotional material. GIVE ME THE MASTER (London: Andrew Melrose, 1906), IN THE HOUR OF SILENCE, A BOOK OF DAILY MEDITATIONS FOR A YEAR (London: Andrew Melrose, 1899), LIFT UP YOUR HEARTS, FOUR ADDRESSES ON SANCTIFICATION (London: Andrew Melrose, 1915), and WAY-FARERS' DAILY MESSAGE (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1933-), are among his best productions. See Pollock, THE KESWICK CONVENTION, passim, for additional details.

48. William Henry Griffith Thomas has not yet been the subject of a biographer.

GY: AN INTRODUCTION TO THE THIRTY-NINE ARTICLES (London: Longmans, Green, 1930), and R. W. Dale,<sup>49</sup> CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1894), is about as close to systematic theology as Keswickians have attained. John Laidlaw, a professor of systematic theology at New College, Edinburgh, worked with the problem of sin in THE BIBLE DOCTRINE OF MAN: OR, THE ANTHROPOLOGY AND PSYCHOLOGY OF SCRIPTURE (Edinburgh: Clark, 1879), and FOUNDATION TRUTHS OF SCRIPTURE AS TO SIN AND SALVATION (Edinburgh: Clark, 1897). More popular in presentation are A. T. Pierson, SHALL WE CONTINUE IN SIN? A VITAL QUESTION FOR BELIEVERS ANSWERED IN THE WORD OF GOD (London: Marshall Bros., 1897), and Jessie Penn-Lewis, THE WARFARE WITH SATAN AND THE WAY OF VICTORY (Leicester: "Overcomer" Book Room, 1906), often reprinted. Steven Barabas, SO GREAT SALVATION, and THE KESWICK WEEK, unfortunately not indexed, contain discussions of the nature of sin. Several addresses from the latter were selected and edited by Herbert F. Stevenson in KESWICK'S TRIUMPHANT VOICE: FORTY-EIGHT OUTSTANDING ADDRESSES DELIVERED AT THE KESWICK CONVENTION, 1882-1962 (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1963), and KESWICK'S AUTHENTIC VOICE: SIXTY-FIVE DYNAMIC ADDRESSES DELIVERED AT THE KESWICK CONVENTION, 1875-1957 (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1959). The view of sin held unofficially by Keswick is Reformed and Anglican, rather than the Wesleyan understanding of Mahan, Boardman, and Arthur.

---

Some data is available in THE NEW INTERNATIONAL DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN CHURCH, ed. J. D. Douglas (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1974). An ardent Anglican, he sought to serve his church as a teacher and scholar.

49. A. W. W. Dale, THE LIFE OF R. W. DALE OF BIRMINGHAM (London: Hodder & Stoughton,

Quite understandably, the primary focus of theological effort has been related to an understanding of the Holy Spirit and the Holy Spirit's work in the believer's life; that is, personal holiness. As mentioned above, Moule, Smellie and Hopkins led the way in the formulation of a Keswickian view of sanctification. Hopkins, *THE LAW OF LIBERTY IN THE SPIRITUAL LIFE* views "Sanctification. . .as a process; that is, as a work wrought in the soul of the believer by the Holy Spirit, subsequently to regeneration." (p. 62) He quotes "Owen on the Work of the Holy Spirit: 'It is begun at once, and carried on gradually.'" He sees sanctification as "a progressive and gradual development of the new creation within the believer" (p. 63).

William MacDowall Aitken, *THE HIGHWAY OF HOLINESS: HELPS TO THE SPIRITUAL LIFE* (London: Shaw, 1883), picks up Hopkins' emphasis, warning against both spiritual dejection about one's "state of grace" and antinomianism. James Elder Cumming, "THROUGH THE ETERNAL SPIRIT": A BIBLE STUDY ON THE HOLY GHOST (Stirling: Drummond's Tract Depot, 1891), is a lucid, more sophisticated treatment of the nature and work of the Holy Spirit. H. C. G. Moule contributed to the discussion, *VENI CREATOR: THOUGHTS ON THE PERSON AND WORK OF THE HOLY SPIRIT OF PROMISE* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1890), an exposition on personal holiness, and an anthology of sermons, *CHRIST IS ALL: SERMONS FROM NEW TESTAMENT TEXTS ON VARIOUS ASPECTS OF THE GLORY AND WORK OF CHRIST* (London: Sampson, Low, 1892), reprinted in the *EXPOSITOR'S LIBRARY* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1912). Both

---

1898) is the biography by a son of this socially concerned Congregationalist pastor-theologian. See also *OXFORD DICTIONARY OF THE CHRISTIAN CHURCH*, p. 369.

volumes represent a concern that the quest for Christian holiness occur within Christocentric perceptions of the workings of God.

Written at the suggestion of, and dedicated to the memory of George H. C. MacGregor,<sup>50</sup> THE THINGS OF THE SPIRIT: TEACHING OF THE WORD OF GOD ABOUT THE SPIRIT OF GOD (London: Marshall Bros., 1898), is a Bible survey by G. Campbell Morgan. Morgan, THE SPIRIT OF GOD (New York: Revell, 1900), is an effort to re-interpret a Keswickian understanding of the Holy Spirit in light of the burgeoning dispensationalist model of the spiritual history of the world. The latter work found popularity primarily in America.

Andrew Murray, the prolific South African author, who was introduced to the higher life by Bishop William Taylor of the Methodist Episcopal Church and a member of the National Holiness Association, has influenced greatly the development of spirituality within the deeper life movement of Europe and America by his often reprinted writings: ABSOLUTE SURRENDER AND OTHER ADDRESSES (New York: Revell, 1897); THE FULL BLESSING OF PENTECOST: THE ONE THING NEEDFUL (New York: Revell, 1908), a manual on being "filled with the Spirit of God"; THE SPIRIT OF CHRIST: THOUGHTS ON THE INDWELLING OF THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE BELIEVER AND THE CHURCH (London: Nisbet, 1888); BE PERFECT! A MESSAGE FROM THE FATHER IN HEAVEN TO HIS CHILDREN ON EARTH (Chicago: Revell, 1894), in Revell's THE BLESSED LIFE SERIES featuring works of F. B. Meyer and Andrew Murray; "LOVE MADE PERFECT" (London: Marshall Bros., 1894); and THE NEW LIFE (London: Nis-

---

50. The life-story is narrated by his son, Duncan Campbell MacGregor, GEORGE H. C. MACGREGOR, M. A., A BIOGRAPHY (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1900).

bet, 1891), revised and abridged by Bethany Fellowship, Minneapolis, 1965, presenting "the holy life of obedience and of fruitfulness in which the Holy Spirit teaches us to walk" (p. 12).

F. B. Meyer, *THE WAY INTO THE HOLIEST, EXPOSITIONS OF THE EPISTLE TO THE HEBREWS* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1893), presents in sermons a chronicle of the Christian progression toward holiness. *THE CHRIST-LIFE FOR THE SELF-LIFE*, also published as *A CASTAWAY* (Chicago: Bible Institute Colportage Association, 1897), is a more conventional anthology on the holy life.

During the somewhat troubled period following the change of leadership from the "old-guard" of Hopkins, Webb-Peploe and Moule to John Harford,<sup>51</sup> son of John Harford Battersby, and to J. Stuart Holden, literary production tapered off as did the success of the Conventions in the tempestuous war era. From this period of transition come J. Stuart Holden, *REDEEMING VISION*, a study of the possibilities of holy living, and *THE PRICE OF POWER*, both published by Revell, 1908. W. H. Griffith Thomas, the remarkable scholar of the holy life, contributed three important volumes. The most comprehensive, *THE PRINCIPLES OF THEOLOGY, AN INTRODUCTION TO THE THIRTY-NINE ARTICLES* (London: Longmans, Green, 1930), published posthumously, presents a traditional Anglican-Keswickian conceptualization of theology. Of excellent workmanship, it remains a valuable resource. *THE HOLY SPIRIT OF GOD* (London: Longmans, 1913), is a thorough,

---

51. Canon John Harford added Battersby to his Harford surname. Battersby was dropped by most of his descendants. See C. F. Harford, *KESWICK CONVENTION* (London: Marshall Bros., 1907), p. 51.



biblical, historical and systematic study of the person and work of the Holy Spirit, originally given in 1913 as the L. P. Stone Lectures at Princeton Theological Seminary. Appended is a series of "Notes" on topics such as tongues, laying on of hands, the baptism of the Spirit, etc., and a bibliography, with the overwhelming majority of titles referring to Keswickian sources. Also see his THE ESSENTIALS OF LIFE (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1935), GRACE AND POWER: SOME ASPECTS OF THE SPIRITUAL LIFE (New York: Revell, 1916), and CHRISTIANITY IS CHRIST (London: Nisbet, 1909).

Of import far in excess of its modest size, W. Graham Scroggie, THE FULNESS OF THE HOLY SPIRIT (Chicago: Bible Colportage Assn., 1925, 22 pps.), is an address given at the Moody Bible Institute of Chicago and published originally in the May 1925 issue of THE MOODY MONTHLY. It is a concise summary of a Keswickian understanding of sanctification. Less concise, but of continuing influence in Keswick circles is John Charles Ryle, HOLINESS: ITS NATURE, HINDRANCES, DIFFICULTIES, AND ROOTS (London: Hunt, 1879), reprinted with an introduction by D. Martyn Lloyd-Jones (London: Clarke, 1956).

Of momentous significance are three volumes by J. Sidlow Baxter: A NEW CALL TO HOLINESS: A RESTUDY AND RESTATEMENT OF NEW TESTAMENT TEACHING CONCERNING CHRISTIAN SANCTIFICATION; HIS DEEPER WORK IN US: A FURTHER INQUIRY INTO NEW TESTAMENT TEACHING ON THE SUBJECT OF CHRISTIAN HOLINESS; and OUR HIGH CALLING: A SERIES OF DEVOTIONAL AND PRACTICAL STUDIES IN THE NEW TESTAMENT DOCTRINE OF PERSONAL SANCTIFICATION (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1967). Summarizing and reformulating in his lucid style, he observes, OUR HIGH CALLING, p. 194, that sanctification, "is a continuous inward renewing by the Divine Spirit, with a view to the transfiguration of

of character." All subsequent work will need to begin with Baxter.

There have been several works which have endeavored to express "the Keswick Position" on the issues of sin, consecration and sanctification. The earliest was THE KESWICK LIBRARY, including works by many prominent Keswick personalities. Published by Marshall Brothers, London, the LIBRARY consisted of: G. H. C. MacGregor, THE HOLY LIFE; F. S. Webster, THE SECRET OF HOLINESS; Evan H. Hopkins, HIDDEN, YET POSSESSED; F. B. Meyer, CALVARY TO PENTECOST; Hubert Brooke, "THEY MIGHT BE." Jer. xiii.11; E. W. Moore, THE LIFE OF FELLOWSHIP; J. T. Wrenford, REALITY; Lucy Bennett, LIFTED LOADS; W. Houghton, THE SECRET OF POWER FOR DAILY LIVING; Sophia M. Nugent, "INSTEAD;" C. A. Fox,<sup>52</sup> VICTORY THROUGH THE NAME; C. G. Moore, "THINGS WHICH CANNOT BE SHAKEN." This LIBRARY, published 1894-1895, wielded considerable influence and individual volumes have been reprinted.

Charles Harford's anthology, THE KESWICK CONVENTION (London: Marshall Bros.), published in 1907, as the torch of leadership was being passed from the founding fathers to the second generation, contains a concise summary of the Keswick "message," written by H. C. G. Moule, Hubert Brooke, A. T. Pierson and J. B. Figgis. A. T. Pierson, FORWARD MOVEMENTS OF THE LAST HALF CENTURY (New York: Funk & Wagnalls, 1900), is also significant, chapter 3 being devoted to "Keswick Teaching," chapter 4 to "Keswick Method."

---

52. Fox, a prominent early Keswick leader, has been the subject of studies by Barabas, SO GREAT SALVATION and by Sophia M. Nugent, CHARLES ARMSTRONG FOX: MEMORIALS (London: Marshall Bros., 1901). For his role in Keswick, see also J. C. Pollock, THE KESWICK STORY.

Nothing, however, has had an impact comparable to Herbert F. Stevenson's four anthologies. The earliest, KESWICK'S AUTHENTIC VOICE (1959), and KESWICK'S TRIUMPHANT VOICE (1963), published by Zondervan, contain addresses delivered at the Keswick Convention from its earliest days. Both are organized around the foci: (1) Sin in the believer, (2) God's remedy for sin, (3) Consecration, and (4) The Spirit-filled life. Later collections, THE MINISTRY OF KESWICK: A SELECTION FROM THE BIBLE READINGS DELIVERED AT THE KESWICK CONVENTION, FIRST SERIES 1892-1919 (1963), and SECOND SERIES: 1921-1956 (1964), published by Zondervan, use similar categories for organization of material. These volumes provide significant information about Keswickian teaching.

Two additional aspects of Christian doctrine have been sporadically prominent, faith healing and eschatology, both having received more attention in American than in British circles. In America, A. J. Gordon, THE MINISTRY OF HEALING: OR, MIRACLES OF CURE IN ALL AGES (New York: Revell, 1882), reprinted in 1961 by Christian Publications, aroused widespread interest. Andrew Murray, DIVINE HEALING (New York: Christian Alliance, 1900), was reprinted in slightly altered form by Christian Literature Crusade in 1971. David Caradog Jones, SPIRITUAL HEALING: AN OBJECTIVE STUDY OF A PERENNIAL GRACE (London: Longmans, Green, 1955), is less than objective in its enthusiastic analysis. Jessie Penn-Lewis, of Welsh revival fame, contributed SOUL AND SPIRIT: A GLIMPSE INTO BIBLICAL PSYCHOLOGY (Bournemouth: Overcomer Book Room, n.d.). S. D. Gordon, QUIET TALKS ABOUT THE HEALING CHRIST (New York: Revell, 1924), is a study of "some principles of healing as taught in God's Word, directly and indirectly" (p. 5). Admiral E. Gardiner Fishbourne, WHOLENESS: OR, HOLINESS AND HEALTH THROUGH FAITH IN THE LORD JESUS CHRIST (London:

Stock, 1882), is prefaced by an essay "Faith Healing No New Doctrine" by Asa Mahan who argues that healing has long been a reputable practice within the church.

Efforts in analysis of the eschaton among early Keswick leaders consisted primarily of sermons, such as, H. W. Webb-Peploe, HE COMETH! (London: Marshall Bros., 1905), J. Stuart Holden, "BEHOLD, HE COMETH!" ADDRESSES ON THE SECOND COMING OF OUR LORD (London: Morgan & Scott, 1918), and H. C. G. Moule, CHRIST'S WITNESS TO THE LIFE TO COME AND OTHER SERMONS (London: Seeley, 1908). These, as the more sophisticated study of R. W. Dale, CHRIST AND THE FUTURE LIFE (4th ed. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1902), are in continuity with the traditional understanding of the Christian church. More heavily influenced by the burgeoning enthusiasm for dispensationalism<sup>53</sup> were G. Campbell Morgan, GOD'S METHODS WITH MAN IN TIME: PAST, PRESENT, AND FUTURE (New York: Revell, 1898), complete with folded colored chart!; SUNRISE. "BEHOLD, HE COMETH!" AN INTRODUCTION TO A STUDY OF THE SECOND ADVENT (New York: Revell, 1912), originally preached as sermons; and William Graham Scroggie, RULING LINES OF PROGRESSIVE REVELATION (London: Marshall Bros., 1918). Also of interest is Herbert Stewart, THE STRONGHOLD OF PROPHECY: IRREFUTABLE EVIDENCE FROM FULFILLED PROPHECY THAT THE SCRIPTURES

---

53. Essential for understanding the complex matrix of millenarian dispensationalism of the early twentieth century is Ernest Sandeen, THE ROOTS OF FUNDAMENTALISM: BRITISH AND AMERICAN MILLENARIANISM, 1800-1930 (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago, 1969). Also helpful, primarily for bibliographies and for summaries of positions is Arnold D. Ehlert, A BIBLIOGRAPHIC HISTORY OF DISPENSATIONALISM (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1965).

ARE THE INFALLIBLE WORD OF GOD (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1935), endorsed by R. H. Stephens Richardson, Chairman of the North Ireland (Keswick) Convention, which begins with a lengthy quotation from C. I. Scofield.

Moody's heirs, perhaps more than Moody himself, have influenced every aspect of American religious life and thought. The higher life movement of which he was the most spectacular example has to a great extent defined what are the accepted patterns of thought and behavior for the typical conservative American Christian. This phenomenon can be considered here only as it revolves around The Moody Bible Institute. There are, however, a myriad of Bible schools, institutes, Bible training centers, denominations, colleges and associations which espouse the Moody model. Although perhaps not its most enthusiastic participant, MBI has provided a seed-bed for the "Evangelical Awakening" of the second half of the twentieth century.

Moody himself wrote two volumes which present a Keswickian understanding of sanctification, both published in Chicago by Revell: SECRET POWER: OR, THE SECRET OF SUCCESS IN CHRISTIAN LIFE AND CHRISTIAN WORK (1881), often reprinted and, THE WAY TO GOD AND HOW TO FIND IT (1884). R. A. Torrey, recipient of Moody's "mantle," wrote extensively on the Spirit-directed life. THE BAPTISM WITH THE HOLY SPIRIT (New York: Revell, 1895), is thoroughly Keswickian rather than Wesleyan, progressive rather than crisis-oriented in emphasis. HOW TO OBTAIN FULNESS OF POWER IN CHRISTIAN LIFE AND SERVICE (London: Nisbet, 1897), is a study designed for laymen, while the following are more technical in expression: THE HOLY SPIRIT, WHO HE IS AND WHAT HE DOES AND HOW TO KNOW HIM IN ALL THE FULNESS OF HIS GRACIOUS AND GLORIOUS MINISTRY (New York: Revell, 1927), and THE PERSON AND WORK OF THE HOLY SPIRIT AS REVEALED IN THE SCRIPTURES AND

IN PERSONAL EXPERIENCE (New York: Revell, 1910), reprinted by Zondervan.

Ironside's anti-Wesleyan-Holiness polemic, HOLINESS, THE FALSE AND THE TRUE has been mentioned. More positive is THE MISSION OF THE HOLY SPIRIT; AND, PRAYING IN THE HOLY SPIRIT (combined ed.: New York: Loizeaux Bros., 1950). Although not directly associated with Moody Church or Moody Bible Institute, James H. McConkey, THE THREE-FOLD SECRET OF THE HOLY SPIRIT (Pittsburgh, Pa.: Silver, 1897), reprinted by Moody, was well received and translated into at least twenty languages. McConkey was an able tractarian. His best are THE ABUNDANT LIFE, GUIDANCE, and LAW AND GRACE, still available from "Back to the Bible," Lincoln, Nebraska. A close friend of McConkey, Robert C. McQuilkin, published "What is Pentecost's Message Today?" in THE SUNDAY SCHOOL TIMES and later reprinted it as THE BAPTISM OF THE SPIRIT: SHALL WE SEEK IT? (Columbia, S. C.: Columbia Bible College, 1935), which attacks both Pentecostalism and "dead orthodoxy." William Culbertson, president of Moody Bible Institute and speaker at both American and British Keswick conventions, has contributed GOD'S PROVISION FOR HOLY LIVING (Chicago: Moody, 1957), and THE FAITH ONCE DELIVERED (Chicago: Moody, 1972).

An intense concern of the American higher life movement, however, was eschatology and prophecy. Sandeen, ROOTS OF FUNDAMENTALISM, chronicles the development of millenarianism and the role of Keswickians, Moody and Scofield within that movement. C. I. Scofield, founder of Dallas Theological Seminary, was the synthesizer of this material in the SCOFIELD BIBLE. See also his ADDRESSES ON PROPHECY (New York: Gaebelien, 1910).

H. A. Ironside, THE LAMP OF PROPHECY, OR SIGNS OF THE TIMES (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1940), followed Scofield's outline while en-

deavoring to avoid extreme positions. Also dispensational in nature was Donald Grey Barnhouse, TEACHING THE WORD OF TRUTH (Philadelphia: Revelation Book Service, 1940). More recently, Wilbur M. Smith, YOU CAN KNOW THE FUTURE (Glendale, Calif.: Regal Books, 1971), and J. Dwight Pentecost, WILL MAN SURVIVE? and PROPHECY FOR TODAY, along with the European scholar René Pache, THE FUTURE LIFE, translated by Helen I. Needham (Chicago: Moody, 1962), have been influential in this area.

A. B. Simpson, THE FOUR-FOLD GOSPEL (New York: Christian Alliance, 1890), reprinted with introduction by F. H. Senft in 1925, placed in perspective the four-fold theological emphases of the Christian and Missionary Alliance: the proclamation of Christ as Saviour, Sanctifier, Healer and Coming King.

Regarding Christ as Saviour, see A. B. Simpson, THE NAMES OF JESUS (New York: Christian Alliance, 1892), and THE FULNESS OF JESUS; OR, CHRISTIAN LIFE IN THE NEW TESTAMENT (New York: Christian Alliance, 1890). The Keswickian alternative of sanctification<sup>54</sup> was predominant in the writings of A. B. Simpson, G. P. Pardington, A. W. Tozer and Oswald J. Smith. Simpson accomplished a major study, THE HOLY SPIRIT: OR, POWER FROM ON HIGH, AN UNFOLDING OF THE DOCTRINE OF THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE OLD AND NEW TESTAMENTS (2 vols.; New York: The Christian Alliance, 1896). WHOLLY SANCTIFIED and A LARGER CHRISTIAN LIFE are more systematic presentations of his views which were reformulated by George P. Pardington, THE CRISIS OF THE DEEPER LIFE.

---

54. The Wesleyan understanding of entire sanctification still has support in the C. & M. A., probably because of its continuing contacts with the HOLINESS MOVEMENT and

Aiden Wilson Tozer, Simpson's successor, has published several items about the holy life (published by Christian Publications, Harrisburg, except where otherwise noted): KEYS TO THE DEEPER LIFE from the series in CHRISTIAN LIFE (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1957); OF GOD AND MEN (1960), in non-technical format; HOW TO BE FILLED WITH THE HOLY SPIRIT, a series of sermons; and THE KNOWLEDGE OF THE HOLY; THE ATTRIBUTES OF GOD: THEIR MEANING IN CHRISTIAN LIFE (New York: Harper, 1961), his most famous work. Also sermonic is THE ROOT OF THE RIGHTEOUS (1955).

Oswald J. Smith, founder and longtime pastor of the famed Peoples Church of Toronto, Canada, is a prolific writer. His best materials focusing upon the issue of sanctification are THE ENDUEMENT OF POWER (1933), revised in 1962, THE SPIRIT AT WORK (1939) and THE LORD IS CALLING (1937), all published by Marshall, Morgan & Scott, London.

Christ, the Healer, was the focus of A. J. Gordon, MINISTRY OF HEALING which led Simpson to an experience of healing and the writing of THE DISCOVERY OF HEALING, THE GOSPEL OF HEALING and LORD FOR THE BODY. Oswald J. Smith, THE GREAT PHYSICIAN (New York: Christian Alliance, 1927), and Thomas J. McCrossan, BODILY HEALING AND THE ATONEMENT (Seattle: McCrossan, 1930), also reflect the concern for healing.

A. B. Simpson, THE GOSPEL OF THE KINGDOM (2nd ed.; 1890) is a vaguely premillennialist analysis based on a series of sermons, as is HEAVEN OPENED: EXPOSITIONS OF THE BOOK OF REVELATION, in the CHRIST IN THE BIBLE series, Vol. XXIV (1899). EPISTLES OF THE ADVENT; OR, THE

---

the number of clergy who have attended Asbury College and Asbury Theological Seminary.



BLESSED HOPE IN THESSALONIANS (n.d.) and THE COMING ONE (1912) are biblical-theological studies, while more allegorical is BACK TO PATMOS; OR, PROPHETIC OUTLOOK ON PRESENT CONDITIONS (1914). All these were published by the Christian Alliance, now Christian Publications, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania.

George Palmer Pardington, the best theologian of the Christian & Missionary Alliance emphasized a pre-millennial dispensationalist approach in OUTLINE STUDIES IN CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE (New York: Christian Alliance, 1916). Oswald J. Smith, with more enthusiasm than discretion published IS THE ANTICHRIST AT HAND? (3rd ed., Toronto: Tabernacle Publishers, 1926), an analysis of Mussolini; and WHEN THE KING COMES BACK (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1957), with an introduction by Wilbur M. Smith, who himself wrote, WORLD CRISES AND THE PROPHETIC SCRIPTURES (Chicago: Moody, 1950), all now hopelessly out of date! Oswald J. Smith, THE CLOUDS ARE LIFTING, (n.d.), studies in prophecy and the visions of Daniel, and PROPHECY - WHAT LIES AHEAD? (1943, 1945, 1947, 1952), both published by Marshall, Morgan & Scott, are more cautious in prognostication and analogy.

For bibliographical hints concerning the theological perspective of the Pentecostals and the Holiness Movement see Faupel, THE AMERICAN PENTECOSTAL MOVEMENT and Dayton, THE AMERICAN HOLINESS MOVEMENT. Within Methodism the trend of the twentieth century was away from a Wesleyan perfectionist understanding and toward a Keswickian perception of sanctification. Exemplary of this move is James Mudge,<sup>55</sup>

---

55. Mudge's own "testimony" appears in FORTY WITNESSES, COVERING THE WHOLE RANGE OF CHRISTIAN EXPERIENCE, edited by S. Olin Garrison (New York: Hunt & Eaton, 1888). More

GROWTH IN HOLINESS TOWARD PERFECTION: OR, PROGRESSIVE SANCTIFICATION (1895), which was viciously attacked by the perfectionist stalwart, Daniel Steele, A DEFENSE OF CHRISTIAN PERFECTION: OR, A CRITICISM OF DR. JAMES MUDGE'S "GROWTH IN HOLINESS TOWARD PERFECTION" (1896), and by Lewis Romaine Dunn, A MANUAL OF HOLINESS AND REVIEW OF DR. JAMES B. MUDGE (1895). Mudge replied by, THE PERFECT LIFE IN EXPERIENCE AND DOCTRINE: A RESTATEMENT, WITH INTRODUCTION BY REV. WILLIAM F. WARREN (1911). All these titles were published in New York by Hunt & Eaton or Eaton & Mains, and in Cincinnati by Cranston & Curts, et al.

Alexander Alonzo Phelps, PURITY AND POWER: OR, THE TWELVE P'S, A RADICAL AND SCRIPTURAL TREATMENT OF THE DOCTRINE, EXPERIENCE AND PRACTICE OF CHRISTIAN PERFECTION (Boston: Advent Christian, 1905), is a work by a Methodist Episcopal writer who draws upon and recommends both the perfectionist holiness and Keswickian writings of Daniel Steele and F. B. Meyer.

### Biblical Studies

Participants at the Keswick Convention have been predominantly pastors, evangelists, missionaries, and Bible school faculty, rather than academicians. This fact is reflected in the biblical studies of Keswick men. These works were seldom seminal, but served to encourage a greater degree of personal Bible study or to indicate support for their theological perspective--at a lay level. The effectiveness of this approach may be seen by the wide distribution the literature has received, and by the extensive support their critical-theological positions have received

---

technical biographical data may be traced through Jones, A GUIDE TO THE STUDY OF THE HOLINESS MOVEMENT, p. 707.

from laity and clergy of all denominations in England and America.

The philosophical concepts controlling their exposition can be found in W. Graham Scroggie, *IS THE BIBLE THE WORD OF GOD?* (Philadelphia: Sunday School Times, 1922), answered affirmatively in the outline: "It seems to be; It claims to be; It proves to be." Scroggie delivered Bible readings at the Keswick Convention twelve times. Hubert Brooke, "Is the Bible Inspired?" in *CAN WE TRUST THE BIBLE? CHAPTERS ON BIBLICAL CRITICISM* (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1908), pps. 1-35, defended his thesis by analysis of prophecy and personal experience. A. T. Pierson, *THE BIBLE AND SPIRITUAL CRITICISM* (New York: Baker & Taylor, 1905), delivered first as the Exeter Hall Lectures on the Bible, is a defense of what would become the Fundamentalist approach to scripture. W. H. Griffith Thomas, "Old Testament Criticism and New Testament Christianity," in *BACK TO THE BIBLE: THE TRIUMPHS OF TRUTH*, by A. C. Dixon, et al. (London: Partridge, 1912), pp. 77-102, maintains that "the old is better" in response to the newly-arrived-in-America higher criticism.

No one was a more severe critic of higher criticism than R. A. Torrey, who for that reason was chosen by Moody to preside over the Chicago (later, Moody) Bible Institute. *DIFFICULTIES AND ALLEGED ERRORS AND CONTRADICTIONS IN THE BIBLE* (New York: Revell, 1907), *TEN REASONS WHY I BELIEVE THE BIBLE IS THE WORD OF GOD* (Chicago: Bible Inst. Colportage Assn., 1898), and especially *THE HIGHER CRITICISM AND THE NEW THEOLOGY: UNSCIENTIFIC, UNSCRIPTURAL, AND UNWHOLESOME* (Montrose, Pa.: Montrose Christian Literature Soc., 1911), defined the American Keswickian approach to scripture. As is obvious from the authors cited, the nature of scripture was a far greater issue in America than in Britain, and continues to be so. Rene Pache, *THE INSPIRA-*

TION AND AUTHORITY OF SCRIPTURE, translated by Helen I. Needham (Chicago: Moody, 1969), continues in the same tradition.

A. T. Pierson, THE BIBLE AND SPIRITUAL LIFE (London: Nisbet, 1908), is an effort to show the practical nature of the scripture and the virtue of personal Bible study. The emphasis of Keswick on both sides of the Atlantic has been to study the text as it stands rather than to engage in higher criticism. This has led to "How to" manuals exemplified by R. A. Torrey, HOW TO STUDY THE BIBLE FOR GREATEST PROFIT (London: Nisbet, 1896); THE IMPORTANCE AND VALUE OF PROPER BIBLE STUDY (Chicago: Moody, 1921); THE NEW TOPICAL TEXT BOOK; A SCRIPTURE TEXT BOOK FOR THE USE OF MINISTERS, TEACHERS, AND ALL CHRISTIAN WORKERS. WITH AN INTRODUCTION ON METHODS OF BIBLE STUDY BY REV. R. A. TORREY (New York: Revell, 1897); and introductions to the Bible such as W. Graham Scroggie, <sup>56</sup> KNOW YOUR BIBLE, A BRIEF INTRODUCTION TO THE SCRIPTURES, 2 vols. (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1940; revised 1953; often reprinted), Scroggie, THE UNFOLDING DRAMA OF REDEMPTION; THE BIBLE AS A WHOLE, 3 vols. (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1953-1970), is a "synthetic" approach, interpreting the Bible as one integral unit.

The commentator par excellence was William Henry Griffith Thomas, whose work greatly influenced evangelical Anglicanism as well as the Keswick Convention. On a methodological

---

56. W. G. Scroggie still holds the record for Bible readings at the Keswick Convention: twelve between 1914 and 1954. THE STORY OF A LIFE IN THE LOVE OF GOD, incidents collected from the diaries of Mrs. James J. (Jane) Scroggie and edited by her son, Dr. W. Graham Scroggie (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1939) provides insights to Scroggie himself.

level are HOW WE GOT OUR BIBLE AND WHY WE BELIEVE IT IS GOD'S WORD (Chicago: Moody, 1926), METHODS OF BIBLE STUDY (Chicago: Bible Inst. Colportage Assn., 1924), and HOW TO STUDY THE FOUR GOSPELS (Philadelphia: Sunday School Times, 1924). Thomas contributed the following to A DEVOTIONAL COMMENTARY SERIES, edited by A. R. Buckland and published by the Religious Tract Society, London: GENESIS, 3 vols., reprinted as one volume (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1946), ROMANS, 3 vols. (reprinted as one volume by Eerdmans, 1946), dedicated to H. C. G. Moule, who contributed the volume, II TIMOTHY to the same series. Much of the material of Thomas, THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES: OUTLINE STUDIES IN PRIMITIVE CHRISTIANITY (Chicago: Moody, 1939), was incorporated in OUTLINE STUDIES IN THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES (Eerdmans, 1956), edited by his daughter who also edited his OUTLINE STUDIES IN THE GOSPEL OF LUKE (Eerdmans, 1950), and THROUGH THE PENTATEUCH CHAPTER BY CHAPTER (Eerdmans, 1957).

Influential since the early era of the Convention has been H. C. G. Moule, THE EPISTLE OF ST. PAUL TO THE ROMANS, EXPOSITOR'S BIBLE SERIES (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1894), often reprinted, and the more scholarly volume in "The Cambridge Bible for Schools and Colleges," THE EPISTLE OF PAUL THE APOSTLE TO THE ROMANS (Cambridge: Univ. Press, 1899).

W. G. Scroggie commented on THE PSALMS, 4 vols. (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1948). On the Acts of Apostles, commentaries were offered by A. T. Pierson, THE ACTS OF THE HOLY SPIRIT, dedicated to A. J. Gordon (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1913), G. Campbell Morgan, THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES (New York: Revell, 1924), and A. Q. Morton and G. H. C. MacGregor, THE STRUCTURE OF LUKE AND ACTS (New York: Harper & Row, 1964). On Romans, in addition to those mentioned above, there are commentaries by A. B. Simpson, THE EPIS-

TLE TO THE ROMANS (Harrisburg, Pa.: Christian Publications, n.d.), and Robert C. McQuilkin, THE MESSAGE OF ROMANS: AN EXPOSITION (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1947).

The Keswickians have been prolific and good Bible expositors. H. A. Ironside has published, through Loizeaux Brothers, notes on Proverbs, Ezra, Nehemiah, Esther, Jeremiah and Lamentations, the Minor Prophets, Daniel, the Revelation and Philippians, all of which have gone through several printings. F. B. Meyer published expositions on most books of the Bible. There is not space to list all of them. The best is THE EPISTLE TO THE PHILIPPIANS: A DEVOTIONAL COMMENTARY (London: Religious Tract Society, 1906). More recent are the works of John R. W. Stott, THE EPISTLES OF JOHN, TYNDALE NEW TESTAMENT COMMENTARIES, Vol. 19 (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964), THE MESSAGE OF GALATIANS (London: Inter-Varsity, 1968), GUARD THE GOSPEL: THE MESSAGE OF II TIMOTHY (Downers Grove, Ill.: Inter-Varsity, 1973), and Herbert F. Stevenson, THREE PROPHETIC VOICES: STUDIES IN JOEL, AMOS, AND HOSEA (1971), and JAMES SPEAKS FOR TODAY (1966), both by Marshall, Morgan & Scott.

Still less technical are numerous Bible addresses. Sir Stevenson Arthur Blackwood,<sup>57</sup> HEAVENLY PLACES. ADDRESSES ON THE BOOK OF JOSHUA (London: Nisbet, 1872), and THINGS WHICH GOD HATH JOINED TOGETHER: ADDRESSES ON ISAIAH XLV. 21-25 (London: Nisbet, 1878); Charles A. Fox, THE SPIRITUAL GRASP OF THE EPISTLES; OR, AN EPISTLE A-SUNDAY (London: Partridge, 1894); George Goodman, THE EPISTLE OF ETERNAL LIFE: AN EXPOSITION OF THE FIRST EPISTLE OF JOHN (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1936); A. T. Pierson, HIS FULNESS: FOUR BI-

---

57. Blackwood was one of Robert Pearsall Smith's supporters who became a leading Keswick Convention personality. See Lady

BLE READINGS GIVEN AT KESWICK IN 1904 ON I CORINTHIANS I.30 (London: Marshall Bros., 1904); and W. H. Griffith Thomas, "LET US GO ON:" THE SECRET OF CHRISTIAN PROGRESS IN THE EPISTLE TO THE HEBREWS (London: Morgan & Scott, 1923). The best of the Bible readings at the Keswick Convention have been edited by H. F. Stevenson in THE MINISTRY OF KESWICK.

### Sermonic and Devotional Studies

The greatest contribution of the Keswick Convention and the higher life movement has been the literature explicating Christian spirituality or devotional literature. Almost every Keswick speaker of note has published a volume of sermons, the largest collection being that of G. Campbell Morgan, THE WESTMINSTER PULPIT, 10 vols. (New York: Revell, 1954-1955), with a topical-textual index published separately in 1954. THE TOZER PULPIT, 5 vols. to date, edited and compiled by Gerald B. Smith (Harrisburg, Pa.: Christian Publications, 1968-), is a major effort to preserve the sermons of the great Christian and Missionary Alliance preacher. THE KESWICK WEEK prints annually the sermons, Bible readings and homilies delivered at the Keswick Convention.

According to some canons of evaluation, all of the literature discussed above might be considered "devotional." In a sense that is true for the goal of Keswick, "the promotion of practical holiness"--always somewhat introspective--has resulted in a richness of spiritual roadmaps for progress in Christian maturity. To list all literature would be far beyond the scope of this essay, and to assert that those mentioned below are the best would

---

Stevenson Arthur Blackwood, SOME RECORDS OF THE LIFE OF STEVENSON ARTHUR BLACKWOOD, K. C. B. (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1896).

be imprudent. Therefore, the method of this section is to introduce the reader to devotional literature by several of the more prominent Keswickian writers. A more extensive list may be found in Barabas, SO GREAT SALVATION.

From the preludes of Keswick, Hannah Whitall Smith, THE CHRISTIAN'S SECRET OF A HAPPY LIFE has retained popularity witnessed by the frequent reprintings by Revell. Early Keswick leaders produced devotional literature of enduring attraction: S. D. Gordon authored the popular series, QUIET TALKS, at least 23 volumes, published by Revell; Alexander Smellie, SERVICE AND INSPIRATION and THE WELL BY THE WAY (London: Melrose, 1904 and 1920); Charles A. Fox, VICTORY THROUGH THE NAME (1894); and H. W. Webb-Peploe, "I FOLLOW AFTER" (1894), WITHIN AND WITHOUT: OR, THE CHRISTIAN'S FOES (1900), the last three published by Marshall Bros., and THE LIFE OF PRIVILEGE, POSSESSION, PEACE, AND POWER (London: Nisbet, 1896).

H. C. G. Moule, the scholar, preacher, bishop, produced CHRIST AND THE CHRISTIAN: WORDS SPOKEN AT KESWICK (London: Marshall Bros., 1919), THE CROSS AND THE SPIRIT (London: Seeley, 1898), and SECRET PRAYER (London: Seeley, 1890). Perhaps no one has been more influential in Keswickian spirituality, though he spoke only once at the Convention, than Andrew Murray who wrote among other things, THE MASTER'S INDWELLING, (1896) and THE INNER CHAMBER AND THE INNER LIFE (1905) both by Revell, THE SCHOOL OF OBEDIENCE (London: Nisbet, 1898), and ABIDE IN CHRIST: THOUGHTS ON THE BLESSED LIFE OF FELLOWSHIP WITH THE SON OF GOD (London: Nisbet, 1883). Many of Murray's works are being reprinted, as indicated in recent editions of BOOKS IN PRINT.

F. B. Meyer, CHRISTIAN LIVING (London: Morgan & Scott, 1888), and THE DIRECTORY OF THE



DEVOUT LIFE: MEDITATIONS ON THE SERMON ON THE MOUNT (New York: Revell, 1904), continue to sustain interest while the once popular writings of W. H. M. H. Aitken, especially THE HIGHWAY OF HOLINESS: HELPS TO THE SPIRITUAL LIFE (London: Shaw, 1883), unfortunately do not. G. H. C. MacGregor, "RABBONI:" OR, PERSONAL CONSECRATION (London: Marshall Bros., 1904), and A HOLY LIFE AND HOW TO LIVE IT (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1894), are complements to the more erudite work of an able scholar.

Jessie Penn-Lewis, of Welsh revival fame was a popular author of devotional literature. THE CROSS OF CALVARY AND ITS MESSAGE (London: Marshall Bros., 1903), has gone through eight editions, and OPENED HEAVENS (Parkstone: Overcomer Literature Trust, n.d.), has been recently reprinted.

The Fleming H. Revell Company published two significant devotional series around the turn of the century. LITTLE BOOKS FOR LIFE'S GUIDANCE included writings such as G. Campbell Morgan, DISCIPLESHIP; Andrew Murray, THE LORD'S TABLE; F. B. Meyer, SAVED AND KEPT, COUNSELS TO YOUNG BELIEVERS, CHEER FOR LIFE'S PILGRIMAGE; J. H. Barrows, I BELIEVE IN GOD THE FATHER ALMIGHTY; and A. J. Gordon, YET SPEAKING, UNPUBLISHED ADDRESSES. THE NORTHFIELD SERIES, addresses delivered at Moody's Northfield Convention included G. Campbell Morgan, THE TRUE ESTIMATE OF LIFE AND HOW TO LIVE. Horatius Bonar, HOW SHALL I GO TO GOD and GOD'S WAY OF PEACE, D. L. Moody, WEIGHED AND WANTING: THE TEN COMMANDMENTS, as well as other authors.

Amy Wilson Carmichael, the Keswick Convention's first missionary, continues to charm Christian readers. EDGES OF HIS WAYS; SELECTIONS FOR DAILY READING (London: S.P.C.K., 1955); GOLD BY MOONLIGHT (London: S.P.C.K., 1935); a book of meditations, IF... (London:

S.P.C.K., 1938); THOU GIVEST...THEY GATHER (Fort Washington, Pa.: Christian Literature Crusade, 1958); and the often reprinted WINDOWS (London: S.P.C.K., 1937), are popular devotional reading.

Devotional writings of other Keswick conventioners are: Theodore Monod, THE GIFT OF GOD (1876); W. Y. Fullerton, THE PRACTICE OF CHRIST'S PRESENCE (1916), and GOD'S INTENTION (1931); and Lionel B. Fletcher, AFTER CONVERSION - WHAT? (1936), all published by Marshall, Morgan & Scott, London; W. H. Griffith Thomas, THE CHRISTIAN LIFE AND HOW TO LIVE IT (Chicago: Moody, 1919); Gordon Watt, THE CROSS IN FAITH AND CONDUCT (Philadelphia: Sunday School Times, 1922). Major W. Ian Thomas, prominent in American and British Keswick circles, THE SAVING LIFE OF CHRIST (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1961), is a popular study in the atonement.

The American Keswickians were also prolific writers of devotional literature. R. A. Torrey, HOW TO SUCCEED IN THE CHRISTIAN LIFE (1906), and REAL SALVATION AND WHOLEHEARTED SERVICE (1905), as well as Robert Speer's addresses at Northfield, "REMEMBER JESUS CHRIST" AND OTHER TALKS ABOUT CHRIST AND THE CHRISTIAN LIFE (1899), were all published by Revell. A. T. Pierson authored CATHARINE OF SIENA, AN ANCIENT LAY PREACHER; A STORY OF SANCTIFIED WOMANHOOD AND POWER IN PRAYER (New York: Funk & Wagnalls, 1898), as well as the more traditional THE BELIEVER'S LIFE: ITS PAST, PRESENT, AND FUTURE TENSES (London: Morgan & Scott, 1905).

James H. McConkey,<sup>58</sup> the founder of Silver

---

58. Louise Harrison McCraw, McConkey's long-time secretary, has written JAMES H. MCCONKEY, A MAN OF GOD (2nd ed., Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1939; reprinted Three Hills, Al-

Publishing Company, a non-profit press, published THE THREE-FOLD SECRET OF THE HOLY SPIRIT, discussed above, and devotional tracts, FAITH, GUIDANCE, CHASTENING, PRAYER, PRAYER AND HEALING and GIVE GOD A CHANCE, all of which are in print with Back to the Bible Broadcast of Lincoln, Nebraska.

Stephen Olford, MANNA IN THE MORNING (1969) and THE SECRET OF STRENGTH (1973) (Chicago: Moody), the size of which belies their influence, have had wide circulation. Alan Redpath published sermons and abstracts of sermons preached while he was pastor of Moody Memorial Church, Chicago: LEARNING TO LIVE (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1961), and BLESSINGS OUT OF BUFFETINGS, STUDIES IN II CORINTHIANS (Westwood, N. J.: Revell, 1965). Donald Grey Barnhouse, an American evangelist who spoke several times at the Keswick Convention, wrote the popular GOD'S METHODS FOR HOLY LIVING: PRACTICAL LESSONS IN EXPERIMENTAL HOLINESS (London: Pickering & Inglis, 1937), THE INVISIBLE WAR (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1965), and LIFE BY THE SON; PRACTICAL LESSONS IN EXPERIMENTAL HOLINESS (Philadelphia: Revelation Publications, American Bible Conf. Assn., 1939).

Oswald J. Smith and the Christian and Missionary Alliance writers, Simpson and Tozer, contributed significantly to devotional literature in addition to their other works. Simpson wrote WALKING IN THE SPIRIT: THE HOLY SPIRIT IN CHRISTIAN EXPERIENCE, (n.d.), THE LIFE OF PRAYER, THE SELF LIFE AND THE CHRIST LIFE (1897) and IN HEAVENLY PLACES (1892) all by Christian Alliance Publishing Company and currently available from Christian Publications, Harrisburg, Pa., as are over forty other volumes by this prolific author.

---

berta; Prairie Bible Institute, 1965).

Tozer, THE PURSUIT OF GOD (1948), THAT INCREDIBLE CHRISTIAN (1964), and MAN, THE DWELLING PLACE OF GOD (1966), are collections of previously published devotional pieces (Harrisburg, Christian Publications). Oswald J. Smith contributed FROM DEATH TO LIFE, and THE SPIRIT FILLED LIFE (New York: Christian Alliance, 1925 and 1926).

Catherine Marshall, BEYOND OURSELVES (1961) consciously attempts to update the work of Hannah Whitall Smith. SOMETHING MORE (1974) is also an expression of higher life concerns. Both are McGraw-Hill publications.

Present Keswick Convention leaders such as Herbert F. Stevenson, THE ROAD TO THE CROSS (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1963), A GALAXY OF SAINTS (Revell, 1958), and John R. W. Stott, CONFESS YOUR SINS (Phila.: Westminster, 1964), MEN MADE NEW: AN EXPOSITION OF ROMANS 5-8 (London: Inter-Varsity, 1966), and CHRIST THE LIBERATOR (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1972), are continuing in the Keswick tradition.

This presentation of the Keswickian tradition of spirituality indicates the diversity and yet the sameness of the concern. There is little change - merely, although importantly, a re-stating of emphases for the Keswick audience and the Christian world.

### Hymnody

The hymnody of the Keswick Convention has, for all practical purposes, been ignored. F. S. Webster, "Keswick Hymns," in THE KESWICK CONVENTION, ITS MESSAGE, ITS METHOD AND ITS MEN, edited by Charles F. Harford, is long on glowing description and void of concrete analysis.

Initially Robert Pearsall Smith, HYMNS SELECTED FROM FABER (Boston: Willard Tract Reposi-

tory; London: W. Isbister, 1874), without music, was received widely. This was replaced by HYMNS OF CONSECRATION AND FAITH: FOR USE AT GENERAL CHRISTIAN CONFERENCES, MEETINGS FOR THE DEEPENING OF SPIRITUAL LIFE AND CONSECRATION MEETINGS, compiled and arranged by Rev. J. Mountain (n.d.), of which a second edition, new and enlarged was compiled by Mrs. Evan Hopkins (1895), both published by Marshall Brothers. THE KESWICK HYMN-BOOK compiled by the Trustees of the Keswick Convention (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, n.d.) was published in the 1930's, followed in 1938 by an enlarged edition. Amy Carmichael published WINGS: A BOOK OF DOHNAVUR SONGS (London: S.P.C.K., 1960-).

In America, A. J. Gordon compiled THE VESTRY HYMN AND TUNE BOOK (Boston: Young, 1872). Moody's movement gave strength to American hymnody and gospel song but produced little that was distinctive. The Christian and Missionary Alliance, led by Simpson, HYMNS AND SONGS OF THE FOURFOLD GOSPEL, AND THE FULLNESS OF JESUS (New York: Christian Alliance, 1891), without music, and HYMNS OF THE CHRISTIAN LIFE; NEW AND STANDARD SONGS FOR THE SANCTUARY, SUNDAY SCHOOLS, PRAYER MEETINGS, MISSION WORK AND REVIVAL SERVICES, ed. Capt. R. Kelso Carter and Rev. A. B. Simpson (New York: Christian Alliance, 1891), with music, has since moved to a more traditional hymnal, basically indistinguishable from those of other denominations, HYMNS OF THE CHRISTIAN LIFE; A BOOK OF WORSHIP IN SONG EMPHASIZING EVANGELISM, MISSIONS AND THE DEEPER LIFE, 1936 (revised and enlarged, 1962).

#### Periodicals: England

THE CHRISTIAN, A WEEKLY RECORD OF CHRISTIAN LIFE, CHRISTIAN TESTIMONY AND CHRISTIAN WORK (London) 1870-1969. Here were reported the Brighton and Oxford conferences as Figgis and E. Hopkins contributed summaries. Other

meetings of the Robert Pearsall Smiths received coverage as did those of Moody. There is not a complete file in the United States. From 1962 to 1969 published by The Billy Graham Evangelistic Association as THE CHRISTIAN AND CHRISTIANITY TODAY.

THE CHRISTIAN'S PATHWAY TO POWER, 1874-1878. Founded by Robert Pearsall Smith, it was, after his downfall, taken up by W. E. Boardman and then by Evan H. Hopkins. It became THE LIFE OF FAITH.

THE LIFE OF FAITH (London), 1878- Formerly THE CHRISTIAN'S PATHWAY TO POWER, it was supervised by Evan Hopkins, although initially edited by Charles Grandison Moore. The editorship has remained in the hands of Keswickians, and the paper remains an unofficial voice of the Keswick Convention. No complete file has been found.

KESWICK WEEK, 1892- The addresses delivered at the Keswick Convention have been published since 1892 under various titles. Except for the war years (1940?-1945) when these appeared as KESWICK IN LONDON or similar titles, the caption was KESWICK WEEK or KESWICK CONVENTION. Reports of conferences 1875-1891 appeared in THE LIFE OF FAITH or its predecessor THE CHRISTIAN'S PATHWAY TO POWER.

SOUTH AFRICAN PIONEER (London) 1- , 1887-

Periodicals: America

NORTHFIELD ECHOES (East Northfield, Mass.) 1-10 (1894-1903). Authors included J. W. Chapman, A. J. Gordon, Mrs. Gordon, T. S. Hamlin, F. B. Meyer, Moody, A. T. Pierson, R. A. Torrey and D. W. and M. J. Whittle.

MOODY CHURCH HERALD, (Chicago) 1902, 1903. Included articles by and about Moody, R. A.

Torrey, W. W. White and A. T. Pierson.

RECORD OF CHRISTIAN WORK (East Northfield, Mass.; 1-18 New York: Revell). 1-52 (1881-1933). Reports on the activities of Hannah Whitall Smith, Moody and Sankey, Andrew Murray and H. W. Webb-Peploe. Important are F. B. Meyer "The New Life," v. 14 (1895), 198-199 and H. W. Webb-Peploe "The True Unity of the Church," v. 15 (1896), 224-225. In April 1904 it absorbed NORTHFIELD ECHOES.

THE INSTITUTE TIE (Chicago) 1: 1-24 Nov. 7, 1891- Oct. 30, 1892; 2: 1-6, Nov. 15, 1892-Feb. 15, 1893. N.S. 1-10, 1900/01-1910. Here were published notes of R. A. Torrey's lectures at the Bible Institute as well as reports of the Moody-Sankey tours of Europe. The subtitle of the magazine varies. Complete file at Moody Bible Institute, Chicago. It became THE CHRISTIAN WORKERS MAGAZINE.

CHRISTIAN WORKERS MAGAZINE (Chicago). October, 1910-August, 1920. Complete file at Moody Bible Institute, Chicago. It became MOODY BIBLE INSTITUTE MONTHLY.

MOODY BIBLE INSTITUTE MONTHLY (Chicago). 1920-1938. Complete file at Moody Bible Institute, Chicago. It became MOODY MONTHLY.

MOODY MONTHLY (Chicago). 1938- Complete file at Moody Bible Institute, Chicago.

THE MID-AMERICA KESWICK WEEK (Chicago). 1959. Only one published. Includes addresses by Alan Redpath, Stephen Olford, C. S. Woods, Paul Rees, Ian Thomas, Allister Smith, Arthur Matthews, H. Wildish and William Culbertson delivered at Moody Memorial Church.

MISSIONARY REVIEW OF THE WORLD (Brooklyn, N.Y.) 1878-1939. 1878-1887 was published as MISSIONARY REVIEW. Edited by A. T. Pierson. While there are no complete files, such could

be compiled. See UNION LIST OF  
2692.

THE OVERCOMER (London: Bournemouth) 1909-  
1914; 1920-1948. Product of the Welsh reviv-  
al era, edited by Mrs. Jessie Penn-Lewis.

ADVOCATE OF CHRISTIAN HOLINESS (Boston) 1-13,  
1870-1881. An American Holiness Movement  
journal whose British correspondent, W. G.  
Pascoe reported work of Smiths, etc. in a  
column entitled, "Work of Holiness in England".  
Published briefly, 1882, as ADVOCATE OF BIBLE  
HOLINESS.

SOUTH AFRICAN PIONEER, American ed. (Brooklyn,  
N.Y.) 1- (Dec. 1920- ). Aug./Sept. 1941,  
merged with British edition.

Periodicals: Christian and Missionary Alli-  
ance

THE WORD, THE WORK, AND THE WORLD (New York)  
1887. It became CHRISTIAN ALLIANCE AND FOR-  
EIGN MISSIONARY WEEKLY.

CHRISTIAN ALLIANCE AND FOREIGN MISSIONARY  
WEEKLY. 1887-1896. It became CHRISTIAN AND  
MISSIONARY ALLIANCE.

CHRISTIAN AND MISSIONARY ALLIANCE. 1897-  
Sept. 1911. It became ALLIANCE WEEKLY.

ALLIANCE WEEKLY. Oct. 1911-Dec. 25, 1957.  
It became ALLIANCE WITNESS.

ALLIANCE WITNESS. 1957- . Note: Volumes  
24-34 are repeated in numbering.



NAME INDEX

- A
- Abbott, J. J., 17  
 Aitken, W. H., 58,  
 77  
 Alexander, Charles,  
 38  
 Allen, R. W., 14  
 Arthur, William, 15,  
 18, 57
- B
- Baird, John, 55  
 Baldwin, H. A., 45  
 Barabas, Steven, 18,  
 26, 34, 38, 39, 55,  
 57, 76  
 Baring-Gould, S., 11  
 Barnhouse, D. G., 67,  
 79  
 Barrows, J. H., 77  
 Battersby, T. D. Har-  
 ford, 24, 26, 32,  
 34, 55, 60  
 Baxter, J. S., 61  
 Baxter, Mrs. M., 29  
 Bennett, Lucy, 62  
 Blackwood, S. A., 74,  
 23, 74, 75  
 Boardman, H. A., 17  
 Boardman, W. E., 16,  
 17, 18, 20, 22, 27,  
 30, 36, 50, 54, 57,  
 82  
 Bonar, Horatius, 12,  
 77  
 Bowker, H. F., 20,  
 24  
 Brandenburg, H., 31  
 Brash, John, 14  
 Brockett, H. E., 46  
 Brooke, Hubert, 62,  
 71  
 Broomhall, Marshall,  
 33
- Buckland, A. R., 73
- C
- Carmichael, Amy, 33, 77,  
 81  
 Carter, R. K., 81  
 Cattell, Everett, 47  
 Caughey, James, 14, 15,  
 16  
 Chapman, J. W., 82  
 Cooke, Sarah, 37  
 Cowper-Temple, W., 19,  
 20  
 Croome, T. M., 24  
 Culbertson, William, 66,  
 83  
 Cumming, J. E., 58  
 Dale, A. W. W., 57  
 Dale, R. W., 57, 64  
 Dayton, D. W., 13, 42,  
 45, 46, 47, 69  
 Dieter, M. E., 12, 15,  
 19, 27, 30, 47, 48  
 Dixon, A. C., 53, 71  
 Douglas, J. D., 57  
 Douglas, W. M., 40  
 Douglass, P. F., 31  
 Dowie, Alexander, 48  
 Drummond, A. L., 31  
 Dunn, L. R., 70  
 Du Plessis, J., 40
- E
- Ehlert, A. D., 64  
 Ekvall, R. B., 51  
 Evans, Eifion, 29
- F
- Failing, G. E., 47  
 Fairchild, J. H., 12,  
 13  
 Faupel, D. W., 42, 48,  
 69

- Figgis, J. B., 26,  
 81  
 Findlay, J. F., 37  
 Finney, C. G., 13,  
 14, 16, 30  
 Fishbourne, E. G.,  
 63  
 Fleisch, Paul, 30,  
 31  
 Fletcher, L. B., 78  
 Fletcher, John, 12  
 Fletcher, R. S., 12  
 Fox, C. A., 62, 74,  
 76  
 Fullerton, W. Y.,  
 39, 78
- G
- Garrard, Mary, 30  
 Garrison, S. D., 69  
 Gathorne-Hardy, R.,  
 22  
 Geiger, Kenneth, 47  
 Getz, G. A., 37  
 Glover, R. H., 50  
 Godbey, W. B., 43,  
 48  
 Goodman, George, 74  
 Goodspeed, E. J., 36  
 Gordon, A. J., 40,  
 48, 49, 50, 63, 68,  
 73, 77, 81, 82  
 Gordon, Mrs. A. J.,  
 82  
 Gordon, E. B., 50  
 Gordon, S. D., 63,  
 76  
 Gray, J. M., 50  
 Guinness, M. Ge-  
 raldine, 33  
 Guyon, Madame, 12, 15
- H
- Hall, John, 36  
 Hamilton, Sir Wm.,  
 14
- Harford, Charles F.,  
 12, 34, 62, 80  
 Harford, John, 60  
 Harries, John, 40  
 Harris, J. R., 21  
 Hay, A. M., 34  
 Head, Albert, 28  
 Hefley, J. C. 51  
 Hills, A. M., 13, 44,  
 46, 48  
 Hitt, R. T., 51  
 Holden, J. S., 33, 60,  
 64  
 Hopkins, E. H., 14, 22,  
 23, 25, 26, 28, 56,  
 58, 60, 62, 81, 82  
 Hopkins, Mrs. E. H., 81  
 Houghton, Frank, 33  
 Houghton, W., 62  
 Hunter, J. H., 51
- I
- Ibister, W., 81  
 Inwood, Charles, 34  
 Ironside, H. A., 46,  
 52, 66, 74
- J
- Jackson, Edna, 20  
 Jellinghaus, Theodor,  
 31, 32  
 Johnson, E. H., 26  
 Jones, Charles, 25, 39,  
 42, 43, 45, 46, 52, 70  
 Jones, Cynddylan, 28  
 Jones, D. C., 63  
 Jones, R. B., 28  
 Jüngst, Johannes, 19
- K
- King, L. L., 51  
 Kropatscheck, F. D., 19

L  
Laidlaw, John, 57  
Latourette, K. S., 35  
Law, William, 12  
Lawrence, Brother,  
12  
Lloyd-Jones, D. M.,  
61

M  
McCheyne, R. M., 12  
McConkey, J. H., 66,  
78  
McCrossan, T. J., 68  
Macdonald, F. C., 55  
MacDonald, George,  
20  
Macfarlane, N. C.,  
35  
McGraw, James, 44  
McGraw, Louise, 78  
MacGregor, D. C., 59  
MacGregor, G. H. R.,  
59, 62, 73, 77  
MacKenzie, Kenneth,  
50  
Maclean, J. K., 28,  
38  
McLoughlin, W. G.,  
13  
McQuilkin, R. C.,  
66, 74  
Mahan, Asa, 13, 14,  
16, 18, 22, 30,  
36, 37, 43, 54,  
57, 64  
Mantle, J. G., 50  
Marshall, Catherine,  
80  
Marshall, Walter,  
12, 54  
Matthews, Arthur,  
83  
Matthews, David, 29  
Melrose, Andrew, 56

Menzies, William, 48  
Meyer, F. B., 28, 29,  
34, 36, 39, 41, 49,  
52, 59, 60, 62, 70,  
74, 76, 77, 82, 83  
Meyer, Louis, 53  
Miller, B. W., 18  
Mitchell, Fred, 23, 26,  
33  
Modersohn, Ernst, 31  
Monod, Theodore, 20,  
21, 23, 78  
Moody, D. L., 16, 34,  
36, 37, 38, 65, 71,  
77, 82, 83  
Moody, P. D., 36  
Moody, W. R., 36  
Moore, C. G., 14, 28,  
33, 62, 82  
Moore, E. W., 25, 62  
Morgan, G. C., 36, 39,  
40, 41, 59, 64, 73,  
75, 77  
Morgan, Jill, 40  
Morgan, J. V., 29  
Morton, A. Q., 73  
Moule, H. C. G., 11,  
24, 26, 54, 55, 56,  
58, 60, 62, 64, 73,  
76  
Mountain, J., 81  
Mudge, James, 69, 70  
Müller, George, 12, 18  
Murray, Andrew, 39, 40,  
54, 59, 63, 76, 77,  
83  
Murray, Harold, 41

N  
Needham, Helen, 67, 72  
Neill, Stephen, 32  
Nugent, Sophia, 62

O  
Olford, Stephen, 79,  
83

Orr, J. E., 15, 16,  
29

Overton, J. H., 11

P

Pache, René, 67, 71  
Padwick, Constance,

34

Page, I. E., 14

Palmer, Phoebe, 14,  
16

Palmer, W. C., 16

Pardington, G. P.,  
50, 51, 67, 69

Pascoe, W. G., 84

Paynter, F., 28

Peck, Gregory, 15

Penn-Lewis, Jessie,  
28, 29, 30, 57,  
63, 77, 84

Pentecost, J. D.,  
67

Phelps, A. A., 70

Phillips, T., 24

Pierson, A. T., 18,  
25, 28, 38, 50,  
52, 57, 62, 71,  
72, 73, 74, 78,  
82, 83

Pierson, D. L., 25

Pollock, J. C., 27,  
29, 31, 32, 33,  
34, 35, 36, 56,  
62

Poole, Richard, 18

Pusey, E. B., 10

R

Radcliffe, Regi-  
nald, 32

Rader, Paul, 50

Rappard, Heinrich,  
31

Redpath, Alan, 79,  
83

Rober

Ruther 12

Ryle, J. C., 61

S

Sandeen, E. R., 41, 64,  
66

Sankey, I. D., 16, 36,  
37, 83

Schmul, H. E., 45

Scofield, C. I., 65, 66

Scroggie, W. G., 61,  
64, 71, 72, 73

Scroggie, Mrs. J. J.,  
72

Senft, F. H., 50, 67

Shaw, S. B., 29

Shipley, Murray, 24

Short, A. R., 18

Simpson, A. B., 48, 49,  
50, 52, 67, 68, 73,  
79, 81

Sloan, W. B., 25

Smellie, Alexander, 23,  
56, 58, 76

Smith, Allister, 83

Smith, Amanda, 20, 21,  
28, 36

Smith, F. W., 19, 21

Smith, G. B., 75

Smith, Hannah W., 18,  
19, 21, 22, 76, 80,  
83

Smith, L. P., 18, 19,  
22

Smith, O. J., 52, 67,  
68, 69, 79, 80

Smith, R. P., 16, 18,  
19, 20, 21, 27, 30,  
36, 54, 74, 80, 82,  
83

Smith, Thornley, 14

Smith, Timothy, 15  
 Smith, W. M., 37,  
     67, 69  
 Speer, R. E., 34,  
     35  
 Steele, Daniel, 45,  
     70  
 Stevenson, H. F.,  
     27, 57, 63, 74,  
     75, 80  
 Stewart, Herbert,  
     64  
 Stock, Eugene, 32,  
     34  
 Stockmayer, Otto,  
     31, 32  
 Stoesz, S. J., 51  
 Stott, J. R. W.,  
     74, 80  
 Strachey, Ray, 22  
 Street, M. Jennie,  
     39  
 Synan, Vincent, 42

T

Taylor, Mrs. F. H.  
     see Guinness M.  
     Geraldine  
 Taylor, J. H., 33  
 Taylor, M. W., 21  
 Taylor, William, 59  
 Thomas à Kempis, 12  
 Thomas, W. I., 78,  
     83  
 Thomas, W. H. G.,  
     12, 56, 60, 71,  
     72, 73, 75, 78  
 Thompson, A. E., 50  
 Thompson, Phyllis,  
     33, 34  
 Thompson, W. R., 47  
 Thornton, G. R., 24  
 Tiesmayer, L., 31  
 Todd, J. A., 17  
 Torrey, R. A., 29,  
     38, 52, 53, 65, 71,  
     72, 78, 82, 83  
 Tozer, A. W., 50, 51,  
     52, 67, 68, 75, 79,  
     80  
 Turnbull, W. M., 50

U

Upham, Thomas, 15, 27,  
     30

W

Warfield, B. B., 15, 17,  
     19, 27, 31  
 Warren, W. F., 70  
 Watt, Gordon, 78  
 Wayland, Francis, 18  
 Webb-Peploe, H. W.,  
     23, 24, 25, 38, 60,  
     64, 76, 83  
 Webster, F. S., 62, 80  
 Wentz, A. R., 31  
 Wesley, John, 12, 47  
 Westcott, B. F., 55  
 Wheeler, W. R., 34  
 White, W. W., 83  
 Whittle, D. W., 82  
 Whittle, M. J., 82  
 Wilberforce, Canon (A.  
     B. O.), 21  
 Wildish, H., 83  
 Wiley, H. O., 44  
 Wilson, Robert, 24  
 Winkler, Fr., 19, 30  
 Wise, Daniel, 14, 15  
 Woods, C. S., 83  
 Wrenford, J. T., 62  
 Wright, James, 18

Z

Zikmund, Barbara, 13

## *B. L. Fisher Library*

The Asbury Theological Seminary library was started in 1939 to meet the needs of a new theological institution based on the teachings of holiness and sanctification in the Wesleyan tradition. It moved to its current building in 1967, when it was named after Bergie Lee Fisher, an innovator in the new and exciting telephone business of the day, and a close friend of Asbury's founder and first president, H.C. Morrison.

The B.L. Fisher Library currently houses a collection of nearly half a million print and electronic resources to help further its educational mission to support the students, staff, and faculty of Asbury Theological Seminary. It also houses several important archival collections, including the papers of E. Stanley Jones, and Hannah Whitall Smith. In addition, the library has focused on building an extensive collection of Pentecostal-Holiness, and Wesleyan material.

In its efforts to provide resources to the greater academic community, B.L. Fisher Library has developed First Fruits Press to supply electronic material freely to a global audience. With this aim in mind, we are proud to present the Occasional bibliographic papers of the B.L. Fisher Library series in an electronic format for scholars unfamiliar with these resources. These works, produced by scholarly librarians, are designed to help researchers locate important sources in key areas of importance to our library users.



asburyseminary.edu  
800.2ASBURY  
204 North Lexington Avenue  
Wilmore, Kentucky 40390



*First Fruits*  
THE ACADEMIC OPEN PRESS OF ASBURY SEMINARY